This Policy Brief provides an overview of key achievements and outstanding issues in carrying out Presidential Instructions on Gender Mainstreaming (INPRES No. 9/2000), aimed at reducing the gap between Indonesian women and men in accessing and obtaining development benefits, as well as to increase participation in and control over the development process. These Guidelines created a momentum for the advancement of women and the promotion of gender equality, which recently extended to gender-inclusive planning and budgeting. There has been some shift in socio-cultural norms and values to better protect the rights of women and men as reflected in several laws that have been revised. There are also signs, however, of an emergence of religion-inspired discriminatory legislation at the local level. The challenge now is to strengthen the implementation of gender mainstreaming by improving legislative and policy frameworks, to enforce coordination of gender mainstreaming efforts among national ministries and all levels of public institutions, and to replicate good practices displayed throughout Indonesia.

Current Status

Indonesia’s Gender Development Index shows that challenges remain to achieving gender equality.

The 2010 Human Development Report (HDR), commissioned by the United Nations Development Programme, ranked Indonesia 108 out of 182 countries according to a Human Development Index (HDI), which measures development by combining indicators of life expectancy, educational attainment and income. The Report also highlighted Indonesia as a country with the greatest progress in recent decades, along with China, Nepal, Lao PDR and the Republic of Korea. The HDI, however, does not measure the degree of gender equality within these development indicators. The Gender Development Index (GDI) aims to show inequalities between men and women in the following areas: health, education, and standard of living. In 2009, Indonesia ranked 93 out of 155 countries. There has been consistent improvement in Indonesia’s GDI, but the country still faces challenges in achieving gender equality in all key development indicators. [Note: GDI is the HDI adjusted downwards for gender inequality. This means that GDI falls when the disparity between the achievement levels of men and women increases. If there is no inequality, the HDI and the GDI will be equal (UNDP.org, 2010)].
Indonesia’s Gender Development Index shows that challenges remain to achieving gender equality.

The current President of Indonesia recognizes gender equality as a development issue (see Box 1). The Medium Term Development Plan (RPJM 2004-2009) contains 38 gender-responsive programs, an increase from 19 in the 2000-2004 Plan. Twenty sector Ministries have now established working groups and gender focal points to mainstream gender in their policies and programs (UN ESCAP, 2010). The 2005 National Poverty Reduction Strategy explicitly includes gender as an element in poverty reduction and commits to work toward gender equality. This Strategy is seen as a ‘test case of the Indonesian government’s ability to realize its pledge to mainstream gender across government sectors’ (Schech and Mustafa, 2010). In addition, the RPJM 2010-2014 reiterates the government’s efforts to mainstream gender with further emphasis on the need to improve women’s quality of life and women’s involvement and consideration in planning, budgeting, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of development policies and programs at both the national and local levels.

Box 1: Presidential Commitment to Gender Equality

“I see democratic development as a constant process of expanding opportunities and empowerment of the people. It is a process to promote gender equality and bring more women into politics. It is a process to reach out to those that are still marginalized.”

President Susilo Bambang Yudhiono, Keynote Speech, Meeting of World Movement for Democracy, April 2010

The prevailing view that gender relations are both a private and culturally specific matter hampers gender mainstreaming efforts at the national and local level.

There is a fundamental lack of understanding about the benefits and importance of mainstreaming gender in Indonesia. The term ‘gender’ is not easily translated into Indonesian and is often misunderstood as a term referring only to women or as an imported Western concept. Gender mainstreaming efforts in both government and non-government sectors remain narrowly focused on increasing female participation rather than more broadly focused on issues of human rights, advancement and empowerment, and disparities between women and men’s economic opportunities.

Gender mainstreaming in development planning and budgeting is not well understood.

The Gender Analysis in Development assessment of 18 ministries and institutions in seven provinces and seven districts, conducted by Indonesia’s National Development Planning Agency (Bappenas) in 2007, found that a lack of gender expertise and proper data-gathering capacities hinders gender mainstreaming efforts in most Indonesian agencies. There is limited use of disaggregated data in policy-making and also low-quality reporting (Bappenas, 2007). A 2009 study showed that only five regions used disaggregated data in their Work Plan and Budget process (Rencana Kerja dan Anggaran, RKA) in that year, although this did not extend to budget drafting or other development plans and policies (Budget Information Indonesia, 2010). A 2010 study of 41 districts/cities confirmed that the district level is still weak in considering...
gender in development planning and budgeting. The budgets studied had various and diverse effects on the arrangement of advocacy programs, program implementation, and the selection of strategies for the given year. The same study revealed that only nine local governments provided facilitation for the implementation of the Ministry of Home Affairs (MoHA) and Bappenas Joint Circular Letter that include provision for minimum number of women’s participation during preparation of Musrenbang (Budget Information Indonesia, 2010).

The successful use of awards to encourage gender mainstreaming efforts at the local level suggests the value of incentives to encourage good practice.

Anugerah Paharita Ekapraya (APE) awards are given in recognition and appreciation of provincial and district governments, as well as sector ministries, that have implemented gender equality through the use of gender-responsive budgeting (GRB). This initiative, from the Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection (MoWECP), has improved institutional compliance with gender mainstreaming requirements, including the submission of progress reports. The province of Central Java received the award in December 2009 and the province of DKI Jakarta received the award for their P2TP2A program that networks services to empower women and children victims of violence (Website P2TP2A, DKI Jakarta). This type of encouragement and accountability needs to be institutionalized further.

While the Government of Indonesia has advanced the protection and empowerment of women by removing gender bias from some laws and regulations, many challenges in national and local laws remain.

A 1999 Decree required the Government of Indonesia to review and improve “laws inherited from colonial era and national laws that are discriminatory, including those that discriminate based on gender and those conflicting with reformasi demand, through a legislation program” (Consultative Assembly Decree No. IV/MPR/1999). With encouragement from civil society organizations and the MoWECP, some laws have been made more gender sensitive and advance the protection of women’s rights, including the following:

- Population Growth and Family Development Law No. 52/2009, which specifies that demographic data should be disaggregated by gender and that poverty should be eradicated among female-headed households
- Elimination of Domestic Violence Law No. 23/2004, which strengthens efforts to eliminate domestic violence and requires provision of services to victims
- Citizen Administration Law No. 23/2006, which adopts a nondiscriminatory principle in serving citizens
- Political Party Law No. 2/2008 and General Election Law No. 10/2008, which requires the nomination of at least 30% women candidates for national, provincial, and district/city level parliaments
- Human Trafficking Law No. 21/2007, which focuses on countering and criminalizing trafficking in persons
A number of national laws are still gender-biased despite advocacy and debate led by the National Commission on Anti-Violence against Women (Komnas Perempuan), civil society organizations, and women’s organizations.

The Ministry of Law and Human Rights reviewed 20 laws and regulations that were considered discriminatory against women. Report on discriminative laws and regulations was also conducted by the Komnas Perempuan in 2009. The following were found to be particularly discriminatory toward women: the Criminal Code (1/1946), the Marriage Law (1/1974), and the Labor Law (13/2003). Controversy remains regarding the Law on Pornography (44/2008) and the Law on Health (36/2009) as well. Both laws contain articles that potentially impair women’s right to make choices regarding her health and expression. There is a current debate regarding a proposed Law on Gender Equality to further strengthen the legal foundation for promoting gender equality.

At the local level, a number of discriminatory laws have been enacted because of decentralization.

While decentralization did make possible regulations that more directly improve the lives of women throughout Indonesia, some regulations enacted since decentralization discriminate against women. Approximately 154 such regulations issued at the provincial, municipal, and village levels from 1999 to 2009 were identified by Komnas Perempuan in 2010 (see Figure 1), of which 63 violate women’s rights concerning expression, protection and work (Komnas Perempuan, 2010). Regional and district level revivals of conservative religious interpretations of gender roles in recent years have led to religion-inspired regulations that restrict human freedoms and rights. At least 82 religion-inspired regulations are violating human rights including restricting women’s movement and choice of clothing as well as freedom to worship according to one’s faith (Komnas Perempuan, 2010). Progress in consolidating Indonesia’s democracy is at risk of being undermined by emerging anti-pluralism and anti-women sentiments that lead to marginalization and the exclusion of minority groups.

Policy Issues

Indonesia’s legal and policy framework for gender mainstreaming creates a strong foundation for improving gender equality and reducing discrimination but is not enforced consistently across Indonesia.

Gender mainstreaming is mandated through the Presidential Instruction on Gender Mainstreaming (INPRES No. 9/2000), that requires all government agencies at national and local levels to mainstream gender into planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of all policies and programs. According
to the Instruction, ministries and agencies at national and local levels are to address gender inequality and eliminate gender-based discrimination. The MoHA regulation No. 15/2008 provides guidelines for gender mainstreaming implementation at the provincial and district level. Indonesia’s Constitution and the ratification of various international conventions show the country’s commitment to gender equality and have influenced the development of effective local laws (see Box 2). In addition, for the first time in the National Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMN) 2010–2014, gender mainstreaming policies are integrated into the planning and budgeting process, which include gender disaggregated policies, indicators and targets from various ministries and agencies. While these regulations, and particularly the gender mainstreaming instruction, have created momentum for gender equality programs and initiatives, the influence is limited by the classification of INPRES No. 9/2000 as an “instruction” as opposed to a “law”, thus differs in their implementation at the local level.

Regional Gender Focal Points from each sector ministry promote gender mainstreaming and work to increase the awareness of government officials on issues of gender equality at the provincial and district level. Women’s empowerment units have also been set up but vary structurally across provinces as a division, unit or badan. Women’s Study Centers have increased from 70 in 1995 to 111 in 2009 in public and private universities across 30 provinces to advise on gender sensitive policy research and assist regional gender focal points to strengthen the capacity of local government staff. About half of the local governments have formed gender mainstreaming working groups (Pokja PUG), of which more than half are not officially recognized. In addition, only five regencies/cities have established gender mainstreaming focal points in each local government office (Satuan Kerja Pemerintah Daerah (SKPD). Overall, more attention is needed to improving coordination and collaboration between all those invested in gender issues and to improve compliance with MoHA Regulation 132/2003 to submit six-monthly progress reports on gender mainstreaming.

**Box 2: Influence of International Conventions on Village Regulations**

The village government of Desa Arjowilangun, Kabupaten Malang, East Java province has issued Village Regulation No. 5/VI/2007 to protect migrant workers from human trafficking. Law No. 07/1984 on the ratification of CEDAW is referred to in the consideration section. In addition, the Laws on Human Rights, Child Protection, and Elimination of Domestic Violence were also mentioned. (Vita, F. et al., 2010)

The Government has established a number of institutions to support the implementation of gender mainstreaming, though inefficiency remains.

NPRES No. 9/2000 positions the MoWECP as the principal advocate for gender equality. The MoWECP is also to provide technical leadership in gender mainstreaming. It has already been instrumental in promoting the use of the Gender Analytical Pathway (GAP) tool, developed in collaboration with Bappenas in 1998. The Law on Ministries, however, lists the MoWECP as the lowest category of ministry, which means it receives a minimal budget and resources and has limited authority within the national government. Improvements in budget, resources and authority will enable the MoWECP to fully participate in the role it is legislated to fill, as a lead in gender mainstreaming all lines of government.
Gender mainstreaming tools are being incorporated into national and local planning and budgeting processes.

The Mid-Term Development Plan for 2010-2014 stipulated that the mainstreaming of gender is required, along with the mainstreaming of sustainable development and good governance, in all policies and program. The 2010 General Guidelines to Implementing Gender Mainstreaming in Local Development from the MoHA mandates all government agencies use gender analysis in the budgeting process. This guideline was further elaborated in the Ministry of Finance (MoF) Regulation PMK No. 119/2009. In 2011, the Gender Budget Statement introduced by this regulation will be expanded to include other sectors, and in 2012 it will extend to the regional level. A pilot was conducted in seven ministries revealing positive outcomes, including programs from the Ministry of Agriculture concerning food security enhancement, and programs from the Ministry of Health concerning the attainment of personal health and public health (Financing for Gender Equality, Deputy Minister for Gender Mainstreaming, 2010).

Other agencies have also formally committed to gender mainstreaming (see Box 3). A number of local governments have started to introduce gender analysis in developing their budgets. Local governments in Java, Sulawesi, Kalimantan and Sumatra are now collaborating with civil society organizations to conduct gender analysis of sectors including health and education, and looking at how budgets for those sectors are able to decrease identified gender gaps. With mandatory women’s participation in the Musrenbang process at village, sub-district, and district/municipality level, stipulated in annual Joint Circulars issued by the Minister for National Development Planning and Minister of Home Affairs, this setting should create more opportunities for women’s concerns to be considered in the development planning process.

The Government and its bilateral development partners have made a strong commitment to improving aid effectiveness, including harmonizing approaches for gender equity.

Indonesia’s development partners have gender equity policies and requirements that are enacted in their programs and are jointly monitored by donors and the Government of Indonesia. The Paris Declaration of 2005 establishes that “gender equality, respect for human rights, and environmental sustainability are cornerstones for achieving enduring impact on the lives and potential of poor women, men, and children. It is vital that all our policies address these issues in a more systematic and coherent way”, (OECD, Aid Effectiveness 2005/2008). Mechanisms are being put in place to increase the harmonization of government and external development partners including more gender assessments of donor projects, such as PNPM.

Box 3: Support and concerted efforts from state agencies is highly needed.

“The Central Board of Statistics is fully supporting the Ministry of Women Empowerment and Children Protection to secure their welfare”

Quote from Rusman Heriawan, Head of the Board, after signing an MOU with the Minister of MoWECP, Linda Amalia Sari in November 2010.
Recommendations

- MoWECP and DPR to raise the status of the Gender Mainstreaming (2000) legislation from a presidential instruction to a law so that it can command the legal power to make obligatory the implementation of gender mainstreaming as a national development strategy. In addition, to further strengthen the legal foundation for promoting gender equality, the MoWECP and the DPR should expedite the deliberation of the Law on Gender Equality.

- MoHA to develop a standard mechanism with the MoWECP to screen local regulations for gender and social discrimination. This could be modeled on the monitoring and abolishing mechanism mandated to the MoF and the MoHA to control anti-business regulations.

- MoWECP to focus on strengthening gender analysis capabilities and forge stronger links with Indonesian gender-concerned NGOs and research institutions.

- All line Ministries, in coordination with MoWECP, to initiate a systematic effort to ensure that all institutions at the national and local level collect sex disaggregated data supported by technical guidelines from the sector Ministries and agencies.

- Bappenas, MoF and MoHA, in consultation with the MoWECP, to ensure that decrees and guidelines promote the use of gender-responsive budgeting at the national level.

- MoWECP to establish gender-sensitive standard performance criteria for all local government programs, requiring reports from the regional and local administration that demonstrate how various sectors and agencies have carried out their responsibilities for gender mainstreaming.

- MoWECP to establish a more efficient and widespread incentive and reward program at the local and provincial level to support and encourage the use of gender-responsive budgeting.

- Bappenas, MoF and MoWECP to improve implementation of Government Regulation No. 8/2008 to ensure women’s full participation in the Musrenbang forum.

References


This Policy Brief provides an overview of four key health areas related to the Millenium Development Goals (MDGs). While important efforts have been made to increase women’s access to health services, more needs to be done in maternal mortality, malnutrition, HIV/AIDS, and water and sanitation to meet the MDGs by 2015. To date, Indonesia is on track to achieve the target for malnutrition while maternal mortality is still lagging as women continue to use inappropriate services, there is an indication of an increasing proportion of adult women living with HIV in Indonesia and having difficulties in getting access to HIV prevention and treatment and water and sanitation targets are unlikely to be met with major concerted efforts.

**Current Status**

- **Maternal Mortality**

  Although 82.3% of births were attended by a professional health provider in 2010, a large number of women, especially but not exclusively the poor, continue to give birth at home without professional help and are at highest risk of dying.

Even with the most recent estimate of 229 maternal deaths per 100,000 live births, Indonesia’s Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) remains among the highest in East Asia, (Hogan et al, 2010). In 2007, deliveries in health facilities represented 46.1% of all deliveries (see Figure 1), (IDHS, 2007). The National Report on Basic Health Research (Laporan Nasional Riset Kesehatan Dasar/Riskesdas) (2010) reported an increase in attended deliveries in health facilities to 59.4%. The Making Pregnancy Safer strategy emphasized the importance of skilled birth assistance and policies to support the strategy – such as improving the availability of midwives through the introduction of the village midwife program in the early 1990s – have been successful in increasing skilled delivery from 36% in 1987 to 77.34% in 2009, (Susenas, 2009). Riskesdas (2010) also suggests an increase of skilled delivery at national level from 40.7% in 1990 to 82.3% in 2010. However, a large percentage of pregnant women (39.1%), continue to give birth at home, assisted by midwives or traditional birth attendants (TBAs), risking delivery complications that can lead to an emergency with often unpredictable outcomes, including death, (Riskesdas, 2010, p.46). The risk is highest when the TBA or midwife does not have the skill to recognize complications, nor to perform the necessary action to save the mother and/or the baby. In cases where the midwife does have the required skills, a lack of supplies may prevent the midwife from taking the required action. Home delivery also becomes more risky if it occurs in remote areas with difficult access to a functioning referral center. The disparity of births assisted by skilled
health personnel among regions ranges from 98.14% in DKI Jakarta to 42.48% in Maluku (Susenas, 2009).

**Figure 1: Home Delivery is Still Preferred (2007)**

![Diagram showing home delivery preference]

Inequities in skilled birth attendance between the richest and the poorest are narrowing, but the richest are more than four times more likely to have a facility-based delivery compared to the poorest.

The coverage of skilled birth attendance among the poorest quintile has improved during the last ten years from less than 20% in 1987 to slightly more than 60% in 2007, while the coverage of the richest quintile has been constant at around 80% (IDHS 2007). Although skilled birth attendance among the poor has increased, almost 90% of deliveries are still at home, compared to less than 20% among the richest quintile. The percentage of deliveries in health facilities in 2007 was higher in urban areas (70.3%) than in rural areas (28.9%). Mothers with no education are much more likely to deliver at home than mothers with secondary or higher education (81.4% and 28.2% respectively). Similarly mothers in the lowest wealth quintile were almost five times as likely to deliver at home as mothers in the highest wealth quintile at 84.8% and 15.5% respectively (see Figure 2). This suggests that the Community Health Insurance (Jaminan Kesehatan Masyarakat/Jamkesmas) has had little effect on facility-based deliveries. Some possible explanations include: (i) Jamkesmas reimburses both facility- and home-based deliveries; (ii) birth delivery at home is still culturally preferable; and (iii) some facility-based delivery costs are not covered by Jamkesmas (for example transport costs and costs for accompanying families).

**Figure 2: The coverage of skilled birth attendance across wealth quintile**

![Bar chart showing coverage of skilled birth attendance]

The quality of the referral system in the case of obstetric complications is still poor.

The quality of the referral system becomes even more important when a high percentage of birth deliveries still occur at home. Many problems in the referral system can be reduced by encouraging a facility-based delivery. Weaknesses in the referral system include, (World Bank 2010):

- delays in making referrals on the part of the birth attendant;
- the birth attendant does not have the necessary skills to stabilize the cases prior to referral;
- referral to a facility not equipped to deal with the emergency resulting in a loss of critical time to manage the complication;
• multiple referral – a case can be referred from one facility to another for various monetary and non-monetary reasons (such as clinic is full or attending physician is unavailable);

• refusal by the family to act on the referral, usually because of fears of increasing costs; and

• referral facility providers do not have the necessary skills to manage the complication.

Complications arising from abortion are another major contributing factor in maternal death.

The contraceptive prevalence rate (CPR) is pretty low. According to SKDI (Survey Kesehatan Dasar Indonesia) in 2007 the CPR is 57.8 %, whereas Riskesdas indicated a lower rate of 53.9 % in 2010. Riskesdas 2010 also identifies the unmet need of 14%. Unmet needs in family planning, including those among single women, contribute to unwanted pregnancy which, in turn, contributes to continuing utilization of abortion services. It is estimated that one to two million abortions take place in Indonesia each year, with many performed by unskilled providers in unsanitary conditions, (Hull et al., 2009). One community survey found that about 24 % of abortions are performed by TBAs (dukun) ranging from 15% in cities to 84% in rural areas, (Utomo et al., 2000). Sixty-six percent of women having abortions reported an induction abortion giving an estimated 1.3 million induced abortions annually. The induced abortion has the potential risk of premature births or low births weight for the subsequent pregnancies. The same study found that one-third of abortion clients were unmarried and half had never used contraception. These issues are politically and socially sensitive but in urgent need of resolution.

Policy Issues

The MDGs Road Map identified MMR as a key area where extra hard work is needed to achieve the target of 102 per 100,000 live births by 2015 (Bappenas, 2010). This is supported by the Government’s eight health development priorities for 2010-2014, which puts enhancement of the health of mother, babies, children under five and family planning as the highest priorities, (RENSTRA Ministry of Health, 2010, p.31 & pp.43-44). The other seven priorities covers different areas that can contribute to this, including community nutritional status; communicable and non-communicable diseases and environmental health management; human resources development and empowerment; availability of and access to secure and well-qualified medicines and food; development of Jamkesnas system; disaster and health crisis management and community empowerment; and better primary, secondary and tertiary health services.

There are two critical measures identified for reducing MMR, i.e. improving the contraceptive prevalence rate and reducing unmet need. This is to be done through expanding access and improving quality of family planning and reproductive health services. Priorities will be focused on expanding better quality health
care and comprehensive obstetric care, improving family planning services and provision of information, education and communication (IEC) messages to the community, (Bappenas, 2010, p.12-13). This is especially to address the issue of high risk pregnancy and abortions that are identified as required special attention by the Ministry of Health. The Continuum Care service is also identified as essential in enhancing the health status and in decreasing the mortality rate of pregnant mothers, babies, and children under 5 years old. This provides integrated health services to mother and babies from pregnancy, natal to post natal health care, with safe delivery as the key concern.

The National Government has seven important planned interventions to achieve the aforementioned MDGs target in 2015: (a) a consolidated vaccination program, (b) an integrated management for sick children under 5 years old (Managemen Terpadu Balita Sakit), (c) reinforcement on a focused nutritional programs, (d) reinforcement of the family’s role including communication strategies for behavioral change and promotion of clean and health behaviors (Perilaku Hidup Bersih dan Sehat-PHBS), (e) an improved health facilities management, (f) a reinforcement of related neonatal strategies, and (g) a reduced geographic, socio-economic and gender gaps in children’s health and nutritional status. In these key areas of interventions, increased access to health services for the poor and those from disadvantaged areas, border areas and islands will be prioritized, (RENSTRA, Ministry of Health, 2010).

**Recommendations**

- Ministry of Health (MoH) to increase demand for facility-based deliveries through behavior change communication towards pregnant women and their family.
- MoH to ensure access of the poor to facility-based delivery and encourage utilization of facility-based delivery by the poor by revisiting the Jamkesmas benefit package and providing better information and communication, as well as improve monitoring of Jamkesmas.
- MoH to improve the Continuum of Care that supports integrated service delivery for mothers and children from pregnancy to delivery, the immediate postnatal period and childhood.
- MoH to coordinate with sub-national health agencies to improve the quality of the referral network from the village to public and private referral centers.
- MoH to establish a quality assurance system for maternal health care based on certification and accreditation of providers and facilities.
- MoH and related agencies to revitalize family planning and address unmet needs through improving service delivery from family planning clinics, providing contraceptives particularly for the poor, and improving promotion and community mobilization through communications, education and promoting partnership with government, NGOs and the private sector.

**Current Status:**

- **Malnutrition**

  **Indonesia continues to have serious stunting and wasting problems, with an almost twofold difference in prevalence seen across the provinces.**

  The national prevalence of stunting is 35.6%, ranged from 22.5% in Yogyakarta to 58.4% in West Nusa Tenggara Province. The national prevalence of wast-
ing is 13.3%, ranged from 7.6% in Bangka Belitung to 20% in Jambi Province, (Bappenas, 2010, p.58). There is considerable maternal under-nutrition contributing to the relatively high level of low birth weight as well as stunting.

Figure 3: Stunting and Wasting of Children Under five, 2007 & 2010.

Anaemia in women continues to be a key issue for nutrition.

Although nationally representative data on anaemia in women is limited and dated, this still seems to be a problem. The National Household Health Survey in 2007 indicated the prevalence of anaemia among pregnant women was reduced from 40.1% in 2001 to 24.5% in 2007. Riskesdas 2007 found that 92.2% of women received iron and folic acid supplementation during the last pregnancy while IDHS 2007 reported that only 79.3% of women received iron supplements during pregnancy. Nevertheless, many mothers do not take sufficient supplements. A more recent study has suggested that 20% of early neonatal deaths could be attributed to a lack of iron and folic acid supplementation during pregnancy (Titalay C.R. et al, 2009 p 1–23). Despite a high coverage of antenatal care, only 33.8% of pregnant women receive a hemoglobin test.

Infant and child feeding practices are far from adequate.

Insufficient exclusive breast feeding, excessive use of infant formula, early complementary feeding and poor quality and frequency of complementary feeding after six months, contribute to wasting and stunting. Poor feeding practices are also contributing to micronutrient deficiencies. During the period 2002 to 2007, there was a drop in children less than six months of age being exclusively breastfed from 40% to 32.4% with a sharp increase of bottle-feeding from 17% to 28% among children of the same age cohort. As breast milk is the optimal source of nutrition for children, this puts young children at a severe disadvantage both nutritionally and for the prevention of illness (IDHS 2007). Only 43.9% of children start breastfeading within an hour of birth and 64.6% receive a pre-lacteal feed. Young children receive complementary foods too early: at 4-5 months of age 52.9% are receiving some form of solid or semi-solid foods while 33.4% of children below two months receive infant formula. Complementary feeding should start from about six months and children should receive three or more food groups a minimum number of times according to their age group in addition to breast milk. Only 67% of mothers offer complementary foods the minimum number of times per age group per day in addition to breast milk, while 75% consume a sufficient number of food groups (IDHS 2007). Only 87.4% and 69.7% of 6-35 month old children were reported to have received Vitamin A and iron-rich foods respectively in the preceding 24 hours.

All districts are expected to provide supplies of Vitamin A supplements for children 6-59 months and postpartum women with the supplements for children to be
to involve relevant ministries in promoting exclusive breastfeeding, (Bappenas, 2010, p.113).

**Recommendations**

- MoH in coordination with sub-national health agencies to implement strategies that empower mothers to improve the nutritional status of their children and themselves rather than them becoming dependent on food supplementation to treat malnutrition, including counseling on breastfeeding, complementary feeding, iron supplementation during pregnancy and Vitamin A supplementation for infants and children.

- MoH in coordination with sub-national health agencies to strengthen support, including monitoring and evaluation, for increasing the nutritional status of pregnant mothers, lactating mothers, and babies, through among others, Nutrition care and Health of mother and Children Program (Program *Bina Gizi* and *Kesehatan Ibu dan Anak*).

**Current Status:**

**HIV/AIDS**

There is an indication of an increasing proportion of adults living with HIV in Indonesia.

The number of HIV/AIDS cases reported in Indonesia is on the increase (see Figure 3). Although the total number of HIV infected individual is relatively low (0.17% of the population), the rate of increase is of concern, (Bappenas, 2010, p.146). Indonesia is considered to have the fastest growing of AIDS epidemic in Asia, (Global AIDS Report, 2008). The cumulative HIV/AIDS cases have been more than doubled from 8,194 in 2006 to 19,973 in 2009 and women now make 25%
of all cases reported. The new cases are concentrated in key populations such as sex workers (who are mostly women) and their male clients plus men who have multiple sex partners apart from their primary partner who are usually women (see Figure 4).

**Figure 4:** Concise summary of indicators on HIV/AIDS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>In 2010</th>
<th>Forecasted in 2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adults living with HIV/AIDS</td>
<td>234,529</td>
<td>320,161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New HIV/AIDS Infections</td>
<td>16,721</td>
<td>19,793</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV/AIDS-related deaths</td>
<td>4,805</td>
<td>5,713</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adults eligible for first-line ART</td>
<td>4,805</td>
<td>85,362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adults requiring second-line ART</td>
<td>92,066</td>
<td>17,299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children exposed to HIV</td>
<td>3,150</td>
<td>4,799</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children infected with HIV</td>
<td>3,105</td>
<td>2,009</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Wilson, David et al., 2011

**Figure 5:** New Infections in 2010

Female sex workers have a higher risk of HIV infection compared to male sex workers and have less access to HIV testing.

While most sex workers in Indonesia are female, a higher percentage of male sex workers (79.1%) reported using a condom with their most recent client compared to 66.6% of female sex workers. The proportion of male sex workers (57.2%) who had received an HIV test at the time of the UNGASS survey was twice as high as for female sex workers (27.8%), (UNGASS Report, 2009).

The coverage of anti-retroviral treatment among HIV-positive pregnant women is very low.

As of December 2009, there were an estimated 5,170 HIV-positive pregnant women in Indonesia. Of that number, only 3.8% received anti-retroviral treatment to reduce the risk of HIV transmission from mother to child indicating that Prevention of Mother to Child Transmission (PMTCT) programs are not yet well established, (UNGASS Report, 2009). Identified constraints include lack of information, lack of facilities for PMTCT and the stigma and discrimination HIV-positive pregnant women face when accessing health care services in hospitals, clinics and other health centers.
Policy Issues

The MDGs Road Map identified the proportion of population aged 15-24 years with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS and the rate of condom use among high risk population as areas that requires special attention. This is especially true with increasing evidences of HIV/AIDS infection through unprotected sex, particularly in Papua where HIV/AIDS has become a generalized epidemic.

The National Government has been active in HIV/AIDS prevention and treatment since the first case in Indonesia, setting-up the National AIDS Commission in 1987 and expanding it under Presidential Instruction No 75/2006 and signing the Declaration on HIV/AIDS (UNGASS) in 2001 and Sentani commitment in 2004. The most recent Presidential Instruction No 3/2010 on equitable development was issued, among other reasons, to accelerate the achievement of HIV/AIDS target of controlling the HIV/AIDS prevalence to <0.5% by 2014, (Bappenas, 2010, p.145). The National AIDS Strategy 2010-2014 promoted scaling up coverage for prevention; increasing and expanding care, support and treatment services; improving access to and use of programs for impact mitigation; strengthening partnerships, health systems, and community systems; and increasing coordination among stakeholders and resource mobilization at all levels.

In 2011, supported by AusAID and the World Bank, the MoH and National AIDS Commission introduced the HIV in Indonesia Model (HIM). The model is useful to define and assess the past, present and future trends of the unique epidemiology, behaviors, populations and geography for practical evaluation as well as development of policies and program in Indonesia. The HIV/AIDS prevention and care efforts have involved several line ministries and relevant national bodies (such as the Coordinating Ministry of Social Welfare, MoH, Ministry of Home Affairs/MoHA, Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of National Education, Ministry of Religious Affairs, the National Bureau for Family Planning), the House of Parliament, and local government. The target for coverage for safe behavior is 80% for key population and 60% population by 2014. This will be a challenge particularly in relation to PMTCT centers that need to scale-up, particularly considering that only 4 to 15% of HIV-positive pregnant women received medical treatment in 2008 (WHO/UNAIDS/UNICEF, 2009). Stigma, discrimination and gender inequality remain the major challenges, (Bappenas, 2010, p.156).

Recommendations

1. Improve the size estimates of populations at risk by improving surveillance and information systems, which includes sexually transmitted infections (STIs) among women, to better understand gender issues in HIV epidemics.
2. Intensify Information, Education and Communication (IEC) that has gender sensitivity to address existing inequalities.
3. Improve access of vulnerable populations to preventive, treatment and care services that recognize different gender needs.
4. National and sub-national AIDS Commissions to continue and improve surveillance and information systems, which includes sexually transmitted infections (STIs) among women, to better understand gender issues in HIV epidemics and improve the size estimates of populations at risk of HIV/AIDS,
5. National and sub-national AIDS Commissions to continue to work closely with NGO to intensify
create a more conducive environment by reduc-
ing stigmatization and discrimination and human
rights violations in implementation of HIV/AIDS
programs.

6. National and sub-national AIDS Commissions to
continue to work closely with NGO sector to im-
prove sensitivity of IEC to ensure that the whole
community is properly educated about HIV/AIDS,
including the different risks and impacts of con-
tacting the virus for women and men, and to re-
duce stigma and discrimination.

7. National and sub-national AIDS Commissions to
further improve access of vulnerable populations
preventive, treatment and care services that rec-
ognize different needs of women and men.

8. MoH to further improve PMTCT programs through
providing better information, improving facilities
for PMTCT and eliminating the stigma and discrim-
ination HIV-positive pregnant women face when
accessing health care services in hospitals, clinics
and other health centers.

Current Status:
• Clean Water and Sanitation

Indonesia’s performance in water and sani-
tation is not sufficient to meet MDGs targets
and community demands.

There has been some progress in expanding access
to clean water supply, though less success with
sanitation and improved hygiene. Currently 47.7%
of the population has access to an improved water
source while 51.2% have access to basic sanitation fa-
cilities with geographical variations, (Bappenas,
2010, p.211). More than half provinces (19 out of 33) have
improved water access at less than the national aver-
age while improved sanitation is lower than the na-
tional average in half (17) the provinces. Open defeca-
tion remains widespread (26% of the total population,
with 36% rural and 16% urban), (UNICEF/WHO, 2010).
The trends suggest that 56% of the rural population
will have safe access by 2015 while access to improved
sanitation in rural areas could remain stagnant at
around 38%. Community demand for improved ser-
dices is apparent with women in particular consistent-
ly prioritizing improved water and sanitation as part
of the Musrenbang and other development planning
activities such as National Community Empowerment
Program (PNPM).

Inadequate coverage and quality of water
and sanitation significantly affects the poor,
particularly poor women.

It is estimated that poor households without access
to improved water are at times paying ten to twenty
times more for their water or have to cover the costs
of fuel to boil their water so it is fit to use, (Bappenas,
2010, p.211). Furthermore the quality and quantity of
drinking water in urban areas has declined while inade-
equate urban sanitation presents risks of increased fe-
cal contamination of the water sources, both of which
particularly affect poor families. Some 30% of Indone-
sians still suffer from waterborne diseases, including
cholera, diarrhea, and typhoid fever, (Bappenas, 2010,
p.211). Women contend with higher risks for infant
and child mortality (with diarrhea still one of the top
five causes of infant mortality) due to lack of clean
water and basic sanitation, as well as physical injuries
from carrying heavy water containers and slipping on
muddy river banks.
Climate change threatens to further increase women's domestic work by undermining the effectiveness of sanitation and drinking water systems through longer periods of drought and more intense periods of rainfall and flooding of water and increasing breeding environments for mosquitoes.

When access is improved, women and children in particular receive significant benefits.

Risksdass 2007 indicates that the number of women (49.7%) responsible for fetching water is slightly higher than men (43.2%), followed by children (7.2% comprising 4% boys and 3.2% girls). Increasing access to improved water will save their time, which for women, allows them to be more involved in income generating, caring for children and participating in community decision making. Access to clean water improves family health and supports better hygiene practices which in turn reduces women's burden in caring for sick family members with water borne illnesses and leads to increased family income through reduced health costs and lost work days. Girls who have reached menstrual age are better able to participate in education when they have access to proper water and sanitation facilities and hygiene education schools.

Policy Issues

The water and sanitation sector is guided by an extensive range of legislation starting with the Constitution 1945 Art. 33, Para 3 which states that “The land and water, inclusive of the wealth contained therein, are the state’s possession and shall be used to the utmost benefit for all the people.” Other legislation such as Law No. 23/1992 on Health, Art 71 affirm the right of all citizens to participate in the development of water and sanitation improvements while Law No. 22/1999 on Regional Governance Para 4 provides for the role of Provincial, District, and Municipal governments “to regulate and manage the welfare of respective local communities based on the initiatives and aspirations of the communities themselves.” The Government Regulation No 16/2005 affirms every province and district to have a Master Plan for Drinking Water Services System.

The role of women in water and sanitation is articulated in the Dublin-Rio Principles which recognizes that “Women play an essential role in the provision, management, and protection of the water supply.” This is reflected in the 2003 national policy on the Community-Based Supply and Environmental Sanitation, developed by a cross-sectoral working group involving National Development Planning Agency/BAPPENAS, MoHA, Ministry of Settlement and Regional Infrastructure (MoSRI), MoH and Ministry of Finance/MoF. One of the key principles adopted in the policy is a non-discriminatory approach, including those based on gender, recognizing that “there is a greater chance of sustainability when women actively participate in the Water Supply and Environmental Sanitation (WSES) development decision-making process”. Nonetheless, women continue to be poorly represented in policy and decision making at national, sub-national and village levels regarding allocation of resources and development and management of improved water, sanitation and hygiene education services.

Government’s efforts to meet the MDGs target of reducing by half the total population that lacks access to safe water supply and basic sanitation by 2015 have included a number of large-scale donor supported Wa-
ter Supply and Sanitation (WSS) programs. However, local investment remains poor as they have yet to recognize water and sanitation as a policy or budgetary priority that can reap significant social and economic as well as health benefits. Economic losses resulting from poor WSS service provision are substantial. A Water and Sanitation Program (WSP)-World Bank study indicates that in 2006 Indonesia lost an estimated IDR 56 trillion (USD 6.3 billion) due to poor sanitation and hygiene, equivalent to approximately 2.3% of GDP, (WSP-WB, 2008, p.1). Substantial efforts have been made to improve government coordination through national and local institutions such as the Task Force on Drinking Water and Environmental Health (Kelompok Kerja Air Minum dan Penyehatan Lingkungan/Pokja AMPL) and to harmonize good practices for sustainable WSS in cooperation with external development partners. However, a study on water and sanitation in 2008 reveals that the average allocation for sanitation was at approximately 2.3% of the total 2003-2005 district budget, which is higher than the 0.18 % at provincial level and 0.036 % at national budget, (Buhl-Nielsen, et al, 2009, p.58).

There is substantial global and national evidence that participatory approaches involving women and the poor result in more sustainable results for water and sanitation and improves water governance, (WSP-WB, 2008). But local governments have been slow in adopting participatory approaches, despite the known benefits and lessons learnt from large scale national WSS programs such as Water and Sanitation for Low Income Community (WSLIC) 1 and 2, (Water Infrastructure Sanitation for Low Income Community, MoH). Currently there are no national or local government guidelines for gender mainstreaming in the WSS sector and little capacity building of relevant local government personnel, including from offices of Public Works and Health. Monitoring of gender participa-

**Recommendations**

- The Task Force on Drinking Water and Environmental Health (Pokja AMPL) to take a lead role in promoting gender equity in WSS by providing and monitoring use of gender mainstreaming guidelines for development of district water and sanitation Master Plans, village development of WSS services, Musrenbang and other village level development processes and household financial decision making.

- Pokja AMPL to promote and oversee improved capacity building for gender mainstreaming at government and community level, including incentives to promote equal opportunities for women and men in policy making and implementation through government and donor funded programs.

- MoHA to increase its capacity building and advocacy to local governments (Pemberdayaan Masyarakat Desa/Rural Community’s Empowerment) to support women’s leadership, particularly of poor women, to strengthen prioritizing of water and sanitation at district, sub district and village levels and increase budget commitments to WSS priorities.

- Pokja AMPL and sectoral agencies to collaborate in developing adequate monitoring and evaluation systems which provides for collection and use of
Sex disaggregated data that demonstrates the value of gender equity as part of an evidence-based approach to investment planning and policy reform.

- MoHA to give increased attention to the policy linkages between improved water and sanitation services and economic development opportunities for women and poor.

References


Ministry of Health, “Water and Sanitation for Low Income Communities (WSLIC) Project”.


Gender disparities among provinces are still found at junior, senior and higher education levels.
than 90 for senior secondary include DKI Jakarta, Jawa Barat, Jawa Timur, Nusa Tenggara Barat, Papua, and Papua Barat (6 provinces). These disparities indicate a need to identify the factors contributing to significantly low achievement in indicators at provincial and district levels to inform gender responsive planning and budgeting.

**Figure 1:** Gender Parity Index (GPI) of Net Enrollment Rates (NER) for Primary (SD/MI/Package A) and Junior Secondary Schools (SMP/MTs/Package B) by Province, 2009

Source: Susenas 2009/Bappenas Report on the Achievement of MDGs in Indonesia 2010

There are significant variations in drop-out between males and females at the primary level in a few provinces. At senior secondary level, national data shows that in eight provinces more female than male drop-outs (ref. Figure 3). In NTT province the primary school drop out rate for males is 8 times that of females (8% and 0.02% respectively). In Bangka Belitung province the junior secondary drop-out rate for males is 7 times higher than females. In Sulawesi Tenggara province the senior secondary drop out rate is 10.98% for males and 8.41% for females. The higher education drop out rate shows 22.5% males and 14.5% females drop out, (MONE, 2008). In Madrasah elementary Islamic schools, significantly more boys drop out at all levels. At Madrasah Ibtdiayah (MI) schools, 61.3% boys drop out, followed by 66.4% at Madrasah Tsanawiyah (MTs) and 57.1% at Madrasah Aliyah (MA), (MORA Website, 2008/2009).

**Figure 2:** Gender Parity Index (GPI) of Net Enrolment Rates (NER) Senior Secondary Schools by Province, 2009

Source: Susenas 2009/Bappenas Report on the Achievement of MDGs in Indonesia 2010

| Drop out rate is higher for males at all levels of education and varies by province |

The government’s provision of non-formal education programs (package A, B and C) particularly for out-of-school children (drop-outs and for boys and girls unable to enroll in formal education), is essential in accelerating progress towards achievement of the MDG goal for basic education. However, programs face problems of coverage and quality with no analysis of the extent to which girls and boys benefit and whether gender gaps are addressed at provincial and districts levels.

**Figure 3:** Drop out rate for Primary and Junior Secondary and by Sex 2003/2004 – 2007/2008


- Primary School (SD/MI) Boys
- Primary School (SD/MI) Girls
- Junior Secondary (SMP/MT) Boys
- Junior Secondary (SMP/MT) Girls
Transition rate for males is higher than for girls at all levels of education in most provinces.

Transition rates for boys are higher than girls from primary to senior secondary school. Provincial-level data reveals that 11 provinces have very significant gender parity gaps ranging between 10-23% higher transition rates for boys. There are 4 provinces in which transition rates for girls are up to 4% higher than boys and one province in which the transition rate for girls is almost 48% higher than boys. Provincial data for junior secondary reveals that transition rates for boys to senior secondary are higher in 31 provinces. There are significant gender gaps in 16 provinces, with the largest gap found in Papua Barat with 38.3% more boys transitioning to senior secondary. This is followed by Kepulauan Riau in which 20.7% more boys transition compared to females. In contrast, Gorontolo province had 9.9% more girl transitioning to senior secondary, (MONE, Bureau of Planning, 2009).

There is a lack of provincial level research to identify factors which determine why more boys or girls transition to the next level of education.

This is needed to inform gender responsive planning and budgeting at provincial and district levels. One study based on a school mapping exercise of 2,126 schools, shows that the transition rate to a higher level of schooling is much lower (by about 20.3 percentage points) for girls leaving junior secondary madrasah than for those leaving a primary madrasah. The study also shows that girls’ transition to the next level of schooling correlates with key aspects of school quality. These are higher qualifications of teachers, the availability of other materials and equipment to support student learning and the availability of separate toilets for girls and boys, (Austen et al, 2009). These results suggest that policies and programs designed to improve these school quality factors will contribute to improving transition and retention of girls in schools.

Government programs have been successful in reducing barriers to access to school facilities for females and males, but there are significant barriers to completing a quality education that is gender-responsive.

Susenas 2009 data highlights gendered responses given in the population aged 7-18 years relating to reasons for discontinuing education. Lack of affordability is an issue affecting more males with 10.78% of males responding they dropped to work and earn an income compared to 8.69% females. Custom is still a powerful factor affecting access (Box 1) with early marriage still a notable barrier with 6.07% of females giving this as a reason for dropping out compared to 0.14% of males. Prevalence of early marriage can be found in Indramayu, West Java and in Nusa Tenggara Timur districts. Regulations are ambiguous regarding support to be given by schools for school-age females who are married, pregnant or young mothers. Distance from school and related safety and cost issues in traveling long distances also presents a barrier to continuing education for more 0.32% of females compared with 0.66% of males in the city and 4.18% of females than 3.98% of males in urban and particularly rural areas, (BPS-Susenas, 2009). Inadequate separate school sanitation facilities for females for menstruation management affects regular school attendance; research in Indonesia suggests the presence of inadequate toilets for girls, (MONE, Bureau of Planning, 2009).

Box 1: Custom still influencing girls’ access to education

In NTT, if a girl goes to school outside the area and stays unchaperoned in a boarding house, her bride price, or ‘belis’, will fall because her reputation will be tainted as a result of a presumption that she is no longer “pure”. Apart from issues related to custom, girls also confront gender bias where parents still prioritize education for boys.
separate toilets in Madrasah raises the transition rates of girls to higher levels of education by 5 percentage points on average, compared to schools without the facility, (Austen et al., 2009).

**Lack of gender-responsive teaching methods and materials is still an issue.**

Teacher training institutions currently do not sufficiently meet the need for trained teachers equipped with skills to understand and address the specific learning needs of both sexes. This includes design and use gender-responsive teaching and learning materials and lesson plans; gender sensitive language in the classroom; classroom set-up; and school management systems. This would create teaching practices that engender equal treatment and participation of girls and boys in the classroom, extra curricula activities and in the wider school community. There is also a lack of teaching materials that meet gender equality standards. While the national Ministry of Education has promote this issue for many years, curriculum textbooks continue to be gender biased and reinforce stereotypes of female and male’s roles and the problem is well recognized: “It has been long known that our educational materials are gender biased,” said Ace Suryadi, Chairman, Ministry of National Education’s Working Committee on Gender Mainstreaming, (Jakarta Post, 10 March 2008).

**Disparity in teachers’ and principals’ gender ratios and qualifications.**

The ratio of female to male teachers has reached 50% or more in all provinces except for Papua, Bali, NTB and Papua Barat. The highest number of women teachers is found in West Sumatra (75.8%) and the lowest in Papua (45.2%), (MONE Website). Out of a total of 1.65 million female teachers, 57% are government employed teachers, compared to a total of 1 million male teachers of which 66% are government employed. Gender equality, in terms of teacher qualifications, has yet to be achieved. 39% of women teachers have the minimum bachelor or diploma degree qualifications compared to 48% of male teachers (MONE PMPTK, 2009). At the primary level, 33% of school principals in public and private schools are women reducing to 14% at junior secondary level and 12% at senior secondary, (MONE Website). Lack of female school principals constitutes a potential constraint in maintaining gender equity, particularly in secondary education where international evidence indicates that the presence of a female school principal correlates strongly with high female enrollment rates and progression to higher education. A study conducted in Indonesia concluded that teacher qualifications have a positive impact on the proportion of female students who transition to the next level of schooling in Islamic schools. A one unit increase in the proportion of teachers with degrees at a school is associated with an 8.7 percentage point increase in the proportion of girls transitioning to the next level of schooling, (MONE Website).

**There is a lack of gender mainstreaming in Islamic schools where there is a higher proportion of female students.**

Given that more females than males attend junior and senior secondary level madrasah, whereas females comprise 48.5% in MI, 50.8% in MTs, and 54.3% in MA in 2008/2009 (MORA Website), quality improvements in Madrasah and a cadre of well-educated female and male teachers trained in gender mainstreaming to have positive gender perspective are likely to contribute to greater gender equality directly, as well as a reduction in economic inequality,
as these schools also cater for large numbers of poor students.

In order to successfully challenge the still dominant patriarchal structure of Islamic education in Indonesia, adequate guidelines and resourcing for gender mainstreaming is needed at all levels. The government is in the process of formulating guidance for gender mainstreaming in Madrasah, which will require wide dissemination and capacity building at all levels to ensure implementation. This should take into account the need for Islamic interpretations with a gender neutral or even openly female perspective and to include these interpretations in the curriculum and textbooks, and/or political instruments aimed at facilitating such an inclusion. All IAIN/UINs Centre for Women Studies have stressed the importance of using a gender approach in research of Islamic studies and are committed to using the results in reforming curriculum and textbooks. Inadequate funding limits the expansion of innovative research initiatives and activities that are taking place at the tertiary level in gender mainstreaming, (Kull, 2009). For example, textbooks have already been produced with a gender perspective for higher education students of Islamic studies at UIN Jakarta. However, insufficient funds have hampered the reprinting of these textbooks. UIN Yogyakarta’s Centre for Women’s Studies (PSW) recommended the formulation of clear policies regulating the share of men and women in all activities, including in leadership, management, and academic positions. They stress the necessity to include both an explicit and implicit gender perspective in the curriculum as well as training for all teachers in implementing gender mainstreaming, (Kull, 2009).

Policy Issues

Gender mainstreaming in the Ministry is mandated through the Presidential Gender Mainstreaming Decree 9/2000. The Ministry of Education was one of the first Ministries involved in developing a gender mainstreaming plan and in identifying Gender Focal Point, producing a gender mainstreaming position paper in 2005, followed by a Ministerial Regulation No. 84/2008 for the sector. The Office of the President and Ministry of National Education has put in place a comprehensive legislative and regulatory framework, including specific presidential decrees for eradication of illiteracy and achievement of 9 years of basic education for all children, guided by the revised National Education Law 20/2003. An analysis as to whether the current policy context is sufficient for successful gender mainstreaming, including an assessment of opportunities and constraints at the policy level is also needed. Policy planning instruments such as qualitative participatory school mapping and parent satisfaction surveys that assess aspects of access and quality and impacts on girls’ and boys’ retention and transition to the next level of schooling can be used to in-
form future planning and resourcing. They can assess how parents’ views affect drop out rates and girls’ and boys’ performance at school and inform awareness raising campaigns directed at parents. For example, school mapping was developed and implemented by MONE and UNICEF while a satisfaction survey has been implemented in Indramayu district by Bappenas with Bogor Agricultural University supported by ADB PRMAP.

Gender equality is mentioned as a national priority in development planning in the National Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMN) for 2010-2014. While there are no specific gender targets, the mainstream educational priorities of the RPJM 2010-2014 should be informed by systematic gender analysis. These include:

a) Increased average school stay of people of 15 years and older (years);
b) Decline in illiteracy rate of population aged 15 and over;
c) Increased net enrollment rate of elementary schools;
d) Increased net enrollment rate of junior high school;
e) Increased gross enrollment rate of senior high schools;
f) Increased gross enrollment rate at universities of those in 19-23 years age bracket; and

The significant increase in budget allocation (20%) reflects the Government’s commitment to educational improvements and an important initiative in 2010 is the Finance Ministerial Decree 119/2009 on the implementation of gender responsive budgets in seven pilot government agency program including Education. Resource rich provinces could accelerate progress by providing matching funds for existing government programs such as scholarships for poor girls and boys to eliminate gender disparities, for example in NER, drop-out and transition rates in districts where needed. For resource poor districts a scholarships strategy and expanded resourcing needs to be considered.

**Recommendations**

- MONE, MORA and MoWECP to coordinate policies and strategies that focuses on the elimination of gender ratio disparities for education indicators at all education levels at provincial and district level and strengthen the implementation of gender mainstreaming in education at all levels.

- MONE to review progress in implementing the Ministerial Regulation 84/2008 on Mainstreaming Gender in Education at school and district levels and to strengthen implementation of Ministerial Decrees aimed at achieving a gender responsive education with capacity building at all levels of the education system.

- MONE and MORA to conduct an assessment in a sample number of schools in different geographical locations to assess ways in which gender policies have been incorporated within school management plans and their implementation.

- MONE and MORA to review from a gender perspective the PP on budgeting for provinces and districts and the Ministry of Home Affairs Regulation 13/2006 on financial management and the Finance Ministerial Decree 119/2009 on Gender Responsive Budgeting.
MONE and MORA to give more attention to underperforming provinces related to gender parity, transition and drop-out ratios through design of additional custom-built strategies, including identifying underlying factors contributing to low achievement of indicators in provinces and districts.

MONE to accelerate existing training programs to improve capacity for gender-disaggregated data collection, analysis and gender responsive planning and budgeting at provincial and district levels for specific indicators.

Accelerate existing education access programs, prioritizing provinces that have significant gender parity gaps in education indicators. These include combined primary & junior secondary schools (Satu Atap), provision of small schools (Sekolah Kecil), satellite schools in poor and remote areas and the conditional cash transfer program. Enhance coverage and quality of equivalency programs (Paket A, B and C), particularly where gender ratio disparities exist in drop-out to enhance access to quality education. An assessment is also needed to determine whether and to what extent this scheme is effective in addressing gender gaps.

Develop a policy and synchronize with national, regional and school policies to ensure that young married, pregnant and young mothers are enabled to continue education. Implement awareness campaigns to reduce the incidence of early marriage and promote continuity of education for early married males and particularly females.

Lembaga Pendidikan Tenaga Kependidikan/LPTKs to review teacher training curriculum to improve development of gender responsive teaching skills and materials.

MONE and MORA to review and improve provision of gender sensitive textbooks at all levels of education, including text and images and equal access to extra-curricular activities in sports, arts and science.

MONE to ensure education financing mechanisms are gender responsive. For example, when financing new school infrastructure and rehabilitation, design schools to ensure the practical needs of males and females are met. The provision of adequate and separate sanitation facilities for females for menstruation management at junior secondary and secondary schools is needed.

MONE and MORA to formulate clear policies regulating the share of qualified males and females in all education (including Islamic education) activities, especially in leadership, management, and academic positions at all levels of education (such a system is already established in the field of representation in political parties and parliament).

Table 1: MDG Goal 3: Promote Gender Equality & Empowerment of Women

<p>| Target 3A: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and in all levels of education no later than 2015 |
| Ratio of Girls to Boys in Primary, Secondary and Tertiary education |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Baseline (1993)</th>
<th>Current (Sosusep 2009)</th>
<th>Target 2015</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ratio of girls to boys in primary schools</td>
<td>100.27</td>
<td>99.73</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>Achieved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio of Girls to Boys in junior secondary schools</td>
<td>99.86</td>
<td>101.99</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>Achieved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio of girls to Boys Senior Secondary Schools</td>
<td>93.17</td>
<td>96.16</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>On track</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio of Girls to Boys Higher education</td>
<td>74.06</td>
<td>102.95</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>Achieved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literacy Ratio of women to men in 15-24 year age</td>
<td>98.44</td>
<td>99.85</td>
<td>100.00</td>
<td>Achieved</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References

Jakarta Post (2008), 10 March 2008

This Policy Brief provides an overview of achievements and gaps for gender equality in the labour market and suggests ways to address shortcomings that are negatively affecting the nation’s economic development. Over the past seven years, average annual growth of women entering labor market has been substantially higher than men, in part due to expansion of service sector employment and progress in women’s education. Yet women continue to face lower participation and higher unemployment rates, poorer quality work and lower wages, limited access to resources such as land and credit and discrimination in hiring and promotion practices in the formal sector, as well as a higher level of informal economic activity. They constitute most self-employed and unpaid family workers as well as Indonesian migrant workers, making them susceptible to personal and financial insecurity, trafficking and other human rights violations. Closing these gender gaps requires giving more attention to equal employment opportunities, particularly in the formal sector, strengthening the fit between women’s training and skills and current labour market requirements through expanding labour markets and income earning opportunities by addressing the causes of labour market segmentation leading to wage gaps and limited career advancement opportunities for women.

**Current Status:**
- **Labour Market**

Despite their growing participation rate, women continue to be more disadvantaged in the labour market than men.

While women are under-represented in the labour force, they are over-represented among unemployed and under-employed, part time and informal sector workers, unpaid workers, people actively seeking work and those not actively engaged in the labour market. Reasons include women being out of the workforce to take care of family, poor access to formal sector employment, culturally defined expectations of appropriate work for women and discriminatory work practices. Women with vocational training do better than their male counterparts when they enter the labour market, because their training is a closer fit with the needs of the growing service sector.

Notwithstanding the sustained economic growth, limited employment opportunities for poor workers, particularly rural women with low levels of education, has contributed to the slow rate of poverty reduction. Although over the past seven years the average annual growth of women entering labor market is well above men (7.2% and 2.2% respectively) their labor...
participation at 52% remains lower than men’s at 84%. It has actually stagnated over the past 5 years and is significantly lower than most other countries in the region. The unemployment rate for women (9%) is close to that of men (8%) and decreasing at a faster rate while their share of total unemployment is lower and has decreased from 48% to 42%. Youth unemployment accounts for 70% of total unemployment with women accounting for almost half of the unemployed youth. The rate of young women’s unemployment is higher than for young men but is decreasing at a much faster rate and is higher for young women with more education. (Note: Unless otherwise specified all temporal trends are comparing 2004 and 2009).

be linked to the fact that women’s rate of underemployment (38%) is higher than men’s (25%), although interestingly women’s underemployment decreased from 42% to 38% while men’s increased slightly from 23% to 25% in 2009.

Table 2: Labor force participation, unemployment and underemployment of the youth (15-29 years)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item (percent)</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working Age Population 15+</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour force participation rate</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment rate</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not in the labour force</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attending School</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housekeeping</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Women represent 75% of those not in the labour force, approximately 50% of non labour force participants who are attending school and 95% of those engaged in housekeeping. This suggests that the main reason behind women’s relatively low labour force participation is still domestic responsibilities which are not shared equally within the household. This may also

The structure of the labor market, the gender division of labor and wage gaps contributes to continuing gaps.

Women are more likely to be informal workers (67.4%) compared to men (62%) with a slight increase for women and a slight decrease for men over the past 4 years. Being a woman increases the probability of working informally by 24%. In the non-agricultural informal sector, men tend to be employed in transportation whilst women (60%) are mostly in household retail and groceries traders. Informal workers face a wage penalty of over 30% compared with workers in the formal sector. This means that if two people share identical qualifications and characteristics (same level of education, age, sex and location) and differ only in their sector of work, the one working in the formal sector would earn 30% more than the one with an informal job. The wage penalty is even larger for informal workers with at least a high school degree; they earn 62% less than workers with identical characteristics in the formal sector. Informal workers are not only worse off in terms of wages but are also less insured, pensioned and trained.
Despite the lure of greater income security, less than 3% of informal workers transition into the formal sector annually - 2.5% for men and 1.8% for women. Between 1993 and 2000, only 2.6% of informal workers transitioned into the formal sector per year, shrinking to 2.2% per year in 2000-07 (Table 3). Slow growth of the formal sector limits job availability. The new entrants to the job market tend to be better educated and more urbanized than before; informal workers who are young, urban and male are the most successful at breaking into the formal job market. Actually it is more common for formal workers to move into informal jobs than the other way around. From 2000 to 2007, an average of 4.4% percent of formal workers moved into informal jobs annually, higher than the level seen in 1993-2000. Formal workers in rural areas who are less educated are more likely to move into informality than those who live in urban areas and are more educated. Although women are more likely to be found in the informal sector, men are slightly more likely to move from formal to informal jobs. Most of those who are self-employed and family workers are female at 67% in 2009.

**Table 3**: Mobility from informality to formality (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt;7 years</td>
<td>per year</td>
<td>&gt;7 years</td>
<td>per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>16.4</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>29.3</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>17.8</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young</td>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: World Bank 2010

The share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector increased from 29% in 2004 to 33.45% in 2009. The total share of women in wage employment in both agricultural and non-agricultural sectors also increased from 29.55% in 2004 to 33.45% in 2009. While the wage levels of female workers have increased, wage discrimination is still prevalent. From 2004 to 2009, the average monthly wage of female workers categorized as employees increased from Rp 676,611 to Rp 1,098,364. In non-agricultural sectors, the average wage of female casual employees also increased from Rp 277,183 to Rp 396,115. Although women’s average wage has increased, there remains a wide wage disparity between women and men. The biggest gap was in casual employees in non-agricultural sectors where women receive only 54% of men’s wages. At the national level, the average monthly wage for female workers in 2009 increased by 61% from 2004, however, women’s average wage was still only 78% of the average male worker’s wage. Wide disparities also exist between provinces.

Looking at the employment sectors in order of their share of the labour market, the majority of women workers (41%) are concentrated in agriculture, where they represent 38% of all workers and suffer from a 17% wage gap. Women are half of all workers in wholesale, restaurants and accommodation, where the wage gap is 25%; 41% of those in social services with a wage gap of 32%; 42 percent of those in industry with the highest wage gap of 44%; and a third of those in finance and business services where the wage gap of 20% is in their favor (see Table 4).

**Table 4**: Gender Division of Labor by Sector, Wage Gap

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th></th>
<th>2005</th>
<th></th>
<th>2007</th>
<th></th>
<th>2009</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male Wage</td>
<td>5,075.12</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>4,737.94</td>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>4,498.88</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>4,931.65</td>
<td>11.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female Wage</td>
<td>1,302.41</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>1,240.44</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>1,188.64</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>1,312.56</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Gap</td>
<td>3,772.71</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>3,497.50</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>3,300.24</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>3,619.09</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source of data: Sakernas 2004 and 2009 Feb

The wage premium for more-educated workers is high and started growing after 2003. The premium is higher for more-educated women and urban workers.
Female workers who have at least completed senior secondary school enjoy the highest wage premiums. On average, during 1990-2007, they earned a premium equal to the wage of less-educated women, while the premium for more-educated men was only 57% on average. Premiums for more-educated men, however, grew at 1.9 percentage points per year during 2003-2007 – more than four times the rate of women’s premiums, which grew at 0.4 percentage points per year.

Gender gaps in employment and wages cannot necessarily be explained by disparities in educational attainment and training. The ratio of girls to boys at all levels of schooling is close to parity and for junior secondary and higher education is in favor of female students. There are, however, significant regional differences to be taken into account for local government planning purposes. Furthermore female students’ choice of vocational training subjects also works in their favor.

Since the financial crisis of 1998, the economy has increasingly relied on the service sector to generate growth. Annual growth in the industrial sector has fallen dramatically, while annual service sector growth remained strong. From 2003 to 2007, employment in the service sector has grown more rapidly than employment in the industrial sector. Furthermore, the service sector commands a wage premium approximately twice that of industry and 4 times that of agriculture. This change in the structure may be negatively affecting male graduates who tend to choose technical and industrial majors over more service-oriented majors in vocational school. Women tend to choose vocation majors compatible with the growing service sector, where educated workers benefit from higher wage premiums: 56% of female SMK students are enrolled in business management and 28.9% study tourism (Figure 1).

**Policy Issues**

**Job creation is essential for reducing poverty and vulnerability.**

Despite modest growth in formal job creation, there has been no progress in removing barriers to this growth. Labor regulatory reform and job creation are included among the Government’s priorities in the National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN 2010-2014). A draft revision of the Labor Law, developed under the supervision of the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration (MoMT), is currently under review by the Ministry of Justice. While the draft introduces some welcome reforms (e.g. greater flexibilities in the use of temporary contracts, which may help stimulate formal job creation), it fails to address problems associated with Indonesia’s current severance system, characterized by high rates (that discourages job creation) and low compliance (that fails to provide real protection, particularly for low wage workers). Slow progress on labor and social security reforms is a cause of concern. The political window of opportunity for movement on either issue is brief, and will begin to close as national elections loom in 2014.
While there is a legal and policy framework in place to support gender equality in the world of work, implementation remains the key issue.

Several legal measurements have been put in place to ensure equal employment opportunities (EEO) such as Law No 80/1957 on Equal Remuneration, Law No 21/1999 on Discrimination (Employment and Occupation), Manpower and Transmigration Ministerial Regulation No 49/2004 on the Structure and Scale of wages, Law No 3/1992 on Social Security covering accidents at the workplace, old age security, life and health insurance, and the Labor Law No 13/2003 on Labor. Other provisions provide for breastfeeding in the workplace, protection of employed women workers at night and gender mainstreaming for the MoMT. Enforcement of these laws and regulations to protect women workers’ rights is necessary for gender equality but some feel that compliance with these laws increases costs to employers and may result in the slow growth of industries and employment opportunities. In 2002, MoMT drafted a paper on “Strategic Thinking on Advancing Gender Equality in Indonesia: Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration Perspective”, as a blueprint for its strategy to advance ILO Conventions 100 (Equal Remuneration) and 111 (Discrimination), which was then incorporated in Law no 13/2003 on Labor. Since 2009, the MoMT has been developing a Code of Practice on Sexual Harassment at the Workplace and in 2010 established an inter-governmental agency taskforce to review and strengthen the implementation of EEO guidelines. The ILO is assisting the Ministry to develop a system for monitoring and evaluating application of these guidelines. Improving workers’ protection is one of the targets set by the Government for achieving the MDGs, specifically under Goal 1: Eradicate Extreme Poverty and Hunger and Goal 3: Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women. In Goal 3, the Government has set targets on employers’ compliance with the protection of women and children’s labor rights in the RPJM 2010-2014 to be implemented by the MoMT. The RPJM outlines priorities to improve protection and facilities to support labor mobility as follows: (a) increasing the role of regional authorities [province/district] in labor protection and facilities; (b) completing the regulation and strengthening institutions for migrant workers’ placement; (c) enhancing services for migrant workers’ placement; (d) increasing protection for migrant workers; and (e) developing information on the foreign labor market.

Recommendations

- Conduct research on factors underlying the low female participation rate in the labor force, gender gaps in wages by sector and type of employment, and barriers to women’s promotion and career development in the formal sector.
- Related ministries and the Centre of Bureau of Statistics (BPS) to improve availability of sex-disaggregated database in order to track trends in the links between education and training and labor participation and remuneration in different sectors, as well as the formal and informal sector.
- MoMT to advocate the uptake of the EEO policy in order to eliminate discrimination in recruitment, promotion, wages, and other employment practices. MoMT to further ensure that private companies adopt an EEO policy to increase productivity through building commitment at all levels and
technical units, training and consultation, developing networking, monitoring and evaluation.

- MoMT to promote legal literacy, using EEO guidelines and other legal instruments for gender equality and non-discrimination in employment. for women workers and their employers.

- MoMT and Ministry of Education to encourage girls to pursue education and training streams which feed into growth areas such as the service sector and promote continuing education and training to encourage women workers to pursue higher level professions.

**Current Status:**

**• Enterprise Development and Access to Finance**

Micro-Small-Medium Enterprises (MSME) form the backbone of the informal sector in Indonesia where the majority of women workers are concentrated. They account for the bulk of employment in Indonesia, employing between 80% (Government of Indonesia/GoI MDG report) to 96% (World Bank, 2010) of the working labour force and for over 99% of all business units. They contribute close to 58% of GDP (GoI MDG report) and yet receive about half of bank credits. The distribution of all firms according to size shows that micro firms form the bulk (83%), while 16% are small, 7% are medium and 0.2% are large. Women run 39% of all micro and small firms and 18% of all medium and large firms (2006 Economic Census as cited in IFC/NORC 2010). The number of women-run SMEs increased by 42% between 2002 and 2007 and in line with global trends, their annual growth exceeds that of men at 8% and -0.27% respectively. There are clear differences between female and male entrepreneurs (see Box 1); most women engaged in micro and petty enterprises at the business margin with a lack of access to the capital and business advisory services necessary for entrepreneurial success, largely due to lack of collateral, complex procedures and legal (licensed) status. They become entrepreneurs mostly as a function of “self-employment by necessity”, due to limited work opportunities and the need to supplement family income whilst also carrying out domestic roles.

A 2006 IFC study on business women’s access to credit found that they are applying for and receiving less credit than men. In the study sample, 11.5% of total loans were disbursed to women, while male borrowers accounted for 88.5%. While legally there is no gender discrimination in access to finance, in practice, women business owners avail themselves less than men to credit, despite the fact that they are considered a better (lower) credit ‘risk’ than male borrowers. Reasons for this could include a higher rate of financial literacy among men than women, a greater likelihood that men have necessary collateral (legal titles for assets such as land, housing, vehicle) and more freedom in decision making, although both spouses in the household must sign loan agreements.

Male and female patterns of accessing financial services do not differ much: women (17%) are only slightly less likely to be “finan-
cially excluded” (not have access loans and savings) than men (17.2%), they are just as likely to have a savings account (68%), 41% of women have bank accounts compared to 40% of men while 49% save informally compared to 47% for men. These results are quite high compared to other countries where the proportion of women with savings accounts is significantly less than men. However, available data does not show the amounts that are being saved, which may reveal gender differences in wealth and financial security. Women have slightly less average amount of debt at USD 771 than men at USD 796 representing 27.3% and 28.1% of household expenditure respectively. Approximately 17.3% of both male and female borrowers take bank loans. Women borrow less than men from Micro Finance Institutions (0.4% and 1% respectively) and community welfare schemes (5.4% and 6.8% respectively) but more from pawn shops (3.4% and 2.5%) and informal sources (44.2% and 41.9%).

**Policy Issues**

Contradictory legislative and policy arrangements contribute to women’s limited access to formal finance institutions.

The 1974 Marriage Law No. 1/1974 provides equal rights and responsibilities between husband and wife while article 31(3) of Law No 1/1971 on Marriage recognizes men as the head of the house and ‘breadwinners’ and women as wives and mothers. The explanatory clauses to Article 61 of Law No 23/2006 on Administration of Population, however, recognize women as the head of household. Article 31 paragraph (2) of the Marriage Law No. 1/1974 stipulated that married women are entitled to perform legal acts (including appearing before the court of justice, entering into contracts and using and owning property). But divorce law provides a greater share of assets to husbands while taxation law identifies men as the subject of taxation meaning that married women must use their husband’s tax number at all times unless they have a specific pre-nuptial contract that allows a couple to separate their assets and income.

Current laws governing access to land and assets, and property ownership do not discriminate against women. These include the Agrarian Law No. 5/1960, the Law on Religious Jurisdiction No. 7/1989 (which covers inheritance) and property ownership for women in the Marriage Law No. 1/1974. Female heads of households (FHH), except those without legal identification as head of households, are eligible for securing land tenure and inheritance for their children, and thus accessing formal credit institutions. Traditional norms and values give men greater de facto claim over asset and land ownership which constrain women’s economic opportunities, particularly in accessing credit and in practice, married women may face limitations depending on their husbands’ awareness of and respect for their legal rights.

Planned mechanisms to expand and strengthen MSMEs should be informed by gender analysis.

The Government aims to promote MSME development through the following measures: facilities to increase the capacity of MSMEs; expansion of cooperatives through entrepreneurship and capacity building on business management; provision of information on services and business consultancy; and expansion of the People-Based Small Business Loan Program (KUR). The Ministry of Home Affairs’ (MoHA) 2010 Regulation No 39, established the Village-owned Cooperative “BUMDES” (Badan Usaha Milik Desa), a new form of village owned cooperative providing goods and servic-
es, including credit, for SMEs. The Ministry of Finance Regulation No 135/PMK.05/2008 clearly outlines government support to accelerate the real sector (i.e. the market of goods and services) and to facilitate access to finance for SMEs and cooperatives by establishing a government sponsored credit guarantee fund. Each of these programs needs to be analyzed further to determine the extent to which women, particularly poor women, are able to gain access to services and build in measures to target women entrepreneurs.

**Recommendations**

- Improve access for poor women start-up entrepreneurs to productive resources such as financial services (loans and savings), financial literacy, business advisory services, improved technology and markets and training and support so they can move from informal to formal sources of finance.

- Enhance legal literacy for women entrepreneurs to better understand their property rights and entitlements under the various laws referred to above.

- Strengthen existing women MSMEs to scale-up their activities, thereby generating more employment opportunities for other women workers.

- Collaborate more systematically with CSO networks, who play significant role in developing and strengthening women-run MSMEs through financial support, capacity building support and advocacy on gender sensitive policy development.

- Related Ministries to improve availability of sex-disaggregated database for women SMEs including on profitability, market segmentation, job creation, development and access to finance (formal, informal, MFIs, commercial banks, etc).

- BPS to integrate Access to Finance module into Susenas to track disaggregated data and links to poverty reduction.

**Current Status:**

- **Migrant Workers**

As the migrant workforce becomes more feminized, it is possibly becoming more vulnerable.

In 2008, women comprised 74% of the total 748,825 Indonesian migrant workers (see Figure 2) reflecting a growing trend for women in this sector. The actual number of overseas workers is estimated to be much higher at about 4.3 million since many more emigrate illegally. Women comprise around three-quarters of Indonesia’s migrant workers, mostly in unregulated domestic work and continue to be one of the least protected in the region. Coming mostly from rural areas with low levels of education, they are vulnerable to unregulated recruitment practices, indebtedness, exploitation and abuse. Women migrant workers are at risk of trafficking: 55% of trafficking victims assisted by International Organization for Migration in Indonesia were exploited domestic workers, 89% of whom were women.

**Figure 2.** Migrant Workers Placement by Sex and Year, 1994-2008 (official data, does not include undocumented migrants)

Economic contribution of migrant workers is hampered by exploitative practices.

High migration fees (official and unofficial) are often financed by migrant workers and their families through debt. These range from USD 350 to USD 950 for legally registered migrants; the fees for illegal arrangements are lower, which explains the high rate of undocumented migrants. Actual salaries are often lower than contract values due to salary deductions from brokers and recruitment agencies and underpayment by employers. Registered migrant workers face barriers in claiming non-wages benefits such as insurance, for which they have paid. Because formal transfers come with high charges and require legal ID, migrants’ savings are often sent back via informal and insecure channels to households that are highly dependent on remittances. Indonesia is one of the top remittance-recipient countries in the world. In 2007 alone, migrant workers sent approximately USD 6 billion in remittances (equal to one-third of foreign direct investment in the same year). Their economic contribution is hampered by the high costs of recruitment, placement and post placement stages, weak legal protection, and income insecurity. This affects both the livelihoods of the migrant workers and the households that depend on their income. Households reported that remittances equaled 80-90% of total household expenditures, regardless of the income level of the household.

There is considerable scope for reducing risk and increasing revenues and household incomes by addressing the barriers to legality that migrant workers face. Indonesia's policy framework is incomplete compared to countries such as the Philippines, placing its female migrant workers at greater risk. The Philippines offer better protection, labor standards and minimum wage provisions, through bilateral agreements, memorandums of understanding, and support services in receiving countries. The Migrant Workers and Overseas Filipinos Act (RA 8042/1995), establishes labor centers in all countries with more than 20,000 Filipino workers. Each center – staffed with a Labor Attaché, Foreign Service Personnel, Welfare Officer, Center Coordinator and, if necessary, an interpreter – provides a comprehensive range of services, including loans to cover the costs of legal disputes, and operates a fund to cover possible repatriation costs if necessary.

Policy Context

The government has put important measures such as Letter No B.80/MEN/SJ-UM/IV/2011 on the establishment on an integrated team for the protection of migrant workers on 15 April 2011. The current legal frameworks and support services available for migrant workers, however, needs to be further strengthened to mitigate their vulnerabilities. The existing laws and regulations do not clearly define roles and negotiating power across government institutions in providing support and services for migrant workers. In addition, as mandated in ICPD 1994 Chapter X on International Migration, urge Governments to address the root causes of migration, to make remaining in one's country a viable option for all people. Inflows of remittances should be fostered by sound economic policies and adequate banking facilities. Countries of destination should consider the use of temporary migration, while countries of origin should collaborate in promoting voluntary return. The exchange of information on migration policies and the monitoring of stocks and flows of migrants through adequate data gathering should be supported. ICPD+15, suggested a more comprehensive approach that addresses the root causes of migrant workers, reintegration process of returning migrants, and more intensive cooperation and dialogue with recipient countries may need to also be envisaged.
Law No. 39/2004 on the Placement and Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers emphasizes placement procedures rather than workers’ protection, and overlooks women migrant workers’ specific vulnerabilities such as sexual harassment and abuse, and limited mobility for live in domestic workers. This law has been revised and is currently with the House of Parliament.

**Recommendations**

- MoMT to develop a comprehensive policy framework to improve protection of migrant workers, with a particular focus on women, especially domestic workers. The Philippines model on the protection policy framework may be used as an example. An agenda of action is recommended to improve the access of migrant workers to formal financial instruments and services, to ensure that poor households benefit from remittance flows, and to enhance data collection on migrant workers by sex, destination, occupation, remittances, wages, abuses and legality.

- MoMT to establish and monitor service standards for the pre-departure training and preparation programs implemented by recruitment agencies and ensure that participants receive comprehensive and detailed information about their contractual and legal rights and have the correct documents and forms to claim entitled benefits (e.g., insurance).

- Pursue bilateral negotiations with all major receiving countries to protect workers, including foreign domestic workers, through agreements or memorandums of understanding.

- Promote the use of standard employment contracts that detail comprehensive rights and benefits for migrant workers. In the absence of legal frameworks, the contract is often the only legal document available to domestic workers. The Philippines also requires employers to register, sign and authenticate employment contracts with their foreign missions.

- Expand support services for migrant workers in Indonesian embassies of all major receiving countries that cover a range of functions that may include: one-stop information services, legal advice, and conciliation services. Facilitate legalization of illegal undocumented migrant workers: to strengthen their protection status, ability to use legal and safe remittance channels, etc.

- Make formal sector instruments and services more accessible and responsive to migrant workers. This can be done by: helping ensure that migrant workers have valid and acceptable forms of identification; customizing financial products and instruments for Indonesian migrant workers, including remittance services, loans and savings; ensuring better assessment techniques of data and regulatory changes; enabling strategic partnerships between remittance service providers (both formal and informal), and expanding the state’s role in encouraging formal transfers.

- Facilitate migrant workers’ and their families’ access to the formal sector financial services providers in two ways: 1) provide financial literacy trainings for migrant workers in partnership with financial institutions, Indonesian embassies and non-governmental organizations and 2) improve physical accessibility to locations where remittances can be deposited, transferred and withdrawn, and improve the user-friendliness of financial institutions.

- Formalize and regulate informal service providers while maintaining their accessibility for migrant workers. Improving competition in order to reduce costs will help ensure that only efficient providers
remain in business. In addition, licensing and regulating informal providers will allow remittances through these channels to be better monitored and tracked.

- Comprehensive data on migrant workers and households is needed and would best be collected through national, regular surveys such as Susenas or Sakernas. This could include data from an annual survey in addition to the panel data from the Indonesia Family Life Survey which would spur further empirical research designed to support policies concerning migrant workers. (Note: Possible research questions include: why and how people migrate; who they are (sex, education level, age, etc) and what kind of jobs they are looking for; to what extent do migration and remittances contribute to economic growth; how do households use additional income from remittances – for consumption, economic development (i.e., purchasing productive assets), or human development (i.e., increased spending on education and health)).

References


IFC/NORC (2010), “Serving the Financial Needs of Indonesian SMEs”, IFC, Indonesia


This Policy Brief provides an overview of key gender equity issues in addressing vulnerability and social protection of the poor. President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono has declared poverty reduction to be his government’s highest development priority. The national poverty rate fell from 16.7% in 2004 to 13.3% in 2010, with no differences between men and women’s consumption based poverty rates. Poverty rates amongst female-headed households (FHH) remain lower than male-headed households (MHH). Over 2004-09, however, while there is a slightly higher percentage of poor MHH than FHH, the overall rate of poverty reduction is slower for FHH than for MHH and the poverty rate for urban FHH is increasing. This is despite the fact that a significantly higher percentage of FHH than MHH benefit from all Social Protection (SP) programs. Improved targeting techniques will reduce exclusion and inclusion errors and ensure that more poor households receive social protection. The challenge will be to ensure that poverty indicators which reflect characteristics of poor and vulnerable FHHs are also included in new targeting mechanisms and that male and female household members have equal access to program benefits within the household.

Current Status: Poverty Reduction

Poverty data reveals specific gender gaps in poverty reduction, particularly affecting urban female headed households.

Poverty reduction has been slow overall, without significant differences between sexes. While there are more poor MHH than FHH, the rate of reduction in poverty among FHH is slower than for MHH, and poverty among urban FHH is actually increasing. Poverty depth and severity indicators are fairly low for both types of households and they are slightly lower for FHH, although the rate of reduction is significantly slower for FHH than for MHH. (Note: The depth of poverty is measured by the poverty gap which adds-up the extent to which individuals on average fall below the poverty line. The poverty severity index is the squared poverty gap index and highlights the level of inequality by putting more weight on the very poor).

The main issues relating to gaps between male and female headed households include (see Table 1):

- FHH represent 14.6% of all households, 15.5% of all urban households and 13.8% of all rural households. Approximately half of all FHH and 47.4% of all MHH are urban. There is no difference between men and women’s poverty rates, which is approximately 14%. Over the last 5 years (2004-2009), the poverty headcount rate decreased by 2.6 percent-
age points for men and 2.4 for women. (Note: All temporal trend lines in this brief are between 2004 and 2009). There is a slightly higher percentage of poor MHH than FHH, based on consumption measures of poverty. Consumption measure of poverty is defined by the value of per capita consumption per day/month. The poverty rate is 11.7% for MHH, and 10.6% for FHH. The rate of reduction in poverty is slower for FHH than for MHH. Poverty decreased by 18% among MHH and by 5.3% among FHH. The near-poverty rate is 22.25% for MHH and 19.44% for FHH. The poverty rate line for the near-poverty rate = poverty line * 1.2. The very poor rate is the same (4%) for both FHH and MHH. The poverty line for the very poor rate = poverty line*0.8. (See Figure 1)

- While overall the rate of poverty reduction in urban areas is slower than in rural areas, there are some significant gender differences. The poverty rate for urban FHH has increased by 9.2%, while it has decreased by 17% for MHH. Among the near-poor in urban areas poverty reduction is higher for MHH at 14% than for FHH at 3%. Given the rapid rate of urbanization in Indonesia this needs to be investigated and addressed further. Poverty is also reducing more slowly for FHH than for MHH in rural areas. The poverty rate for rural FHH has decreased by 8%, while it has decreased by 16% for MHH.
- An examination of the depth (poverty gap index) and severity (poverty gap squared) of poverty among male and female headed households reveals similar trends. While the actual levels for MHH and FHH are currently similar and relatively low, the reduction is more pronounced for MHH than for FHH, particularly in urban areas, where the depth of poverty has reduced by 21% for MHH compared to 7% for FHH, and severity of poverty has reduced 25% for MHH and 19% for FHH. In rural areas both depth and severity of poverty has decreased by 16% among MHH and 13% among FHH. (See Table 1)

### Table 1: Consumption based poverty measure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator (%)</th>
<th>National</th>
<th>Urban</th>
<th>Rural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MHH as percentage of total HH</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHH as percentage of total HH</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>(0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of all urban MHH</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>(0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of all urban FHH</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>(0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor individuals in the population</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>(3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor MHH</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>(2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor FHH</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>(4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Near poor MHH</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>(3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Near poor FHH</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>(2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHH P1: depth</td>
<td>7.50</td>
<td>2.01</td>
<td>(19.64)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHH P1</td>
<td>7.04</td>
<td>1.78</td>
<td>(76.51)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHH P2: poverty</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>(18.36)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHH P2</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>(18.68)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Susenas 2004, 2009, World Bank calculations. (Individuals is poverty headcount rate by sex of individuals in poor households. HOH is poverty rate of households by head-of-household gender).

- Possible explanations for the slower rate of poverty reduction for FHH than for MHH include: FHH typically only have one adult income earner (in the absence of a working male adult), coupled with coping strategies used by FHH to maintain relatively equal levels of consumption such as keeping children out of school for income generation or saving on school fees. Indeed while the percentage of poor children (between the ages of 6 and 15) not in school are even at national level (ap-
proximately 18% for both MHH and FHH) there are opposite trends in urban and rural areas. There is a higher rate of poor children out of school in poor urban FHH (19%) than in MHH (15%), while there is a lower rate of children out of school in rural FHH (17%) than MHH (20%). On the other hand, there is consistently a higher rate of poor children working in rural areas than in urban areas, and this is higher in FHH (12%) than in MHH (8%). The percentage of poor working children among urban FHH decreased from 12% to 2% over the same period which saw an increase in urban FHH poverty, possibly indicating past reliance of urban FHH on income from child labour (see Table 2).

**Table 2: Non-consumption poverty measures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MHH Not in school*</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHH Working children**</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHH Not in school*</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHH Working children**</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


- Other non-income or consumption based indicators of poverty which are typical of FHH include the absence or sale of assets and absence or use of savings for consumption as opposed to production. Currently there is insufficient analysis on this issue and further research is needed to examine possible causes of the increase in urban poverty among FHH, as well as the challenges FHH in general face in escaping poverty, in order to better target vulnerable FHH.

**Current Status:**
- **Social Protection**

While FHH tend to benefit slightly disproportionately from social assistance protection benefits, there remain significant inclusion and exclusion biases for both poor FHH and MHH.

Males and females are equally distributed among households receiving social assistance, but female-led households are consistently more likely than any other sub-group to be beneficiaries, even if they have high levels of consumption. This suggests that communities consider them more deserving of assistance than other households. While FHH are not specifically targeted by social protection programs (with the exception of PEKKA, see below), decisions regarding which households should receive assistance are often made at the community level, and FHH are often considered poorer than MHH based on local level perceptions and knowledge. However, for both FHH and MHH, there are significant inclusion and exclusion biases (some non poor households who are not eligible are receiving assistance while some poor households who are eligible are not (see Figure 1 and Figure 2).

**Figure 2: Percentage of Consumption Decile Receiving BLT Benefits (2008-09), by sub-group**

Source: Susenas 2009, World Bank calculations
Among the poor, most urban households are non-beneficiaries. The targeting methodology is currently being revised, with an emphasis on transparent measurable indicators of poverty, and the implications for FHH needs to be carefully considered in the selection of these indicators (see above on non-consumption indicators). The gender impact of Conditional Cash Transfers/CCT program (Program Keluarga Harapan/ PKH) is different for MHH and FHH indicating a difference in intra-household decision making and spending choices. FHH seems to prioritise delivery antenatal and postnatal care for mothers, while MHH place more emphasis on children’s health care, and overall boys’ health care was favoured over that of girls.

## Policy Issues

The social assistance programs have been delivered under different channels such as PNPM Mandiri. The main issues related to social assistance programs include:

- **Raskin**, a subsidized rice program, for the poor has existed in Indonesia in some form since the Asian Crisis in 1997-1998. Under the current Raskin program, the National Logistics Agency (BULOG) purchases the rice from wholesalers using a subsidy from the government. The rice is then distributed to villages, where eligible households are able to buy up to a set quantity of rice at considerably less than market prices. While the Raskin program does not include gender specific considerations in its operations, FHH across all deciles are more likely to receive Raskin benefits than MHH: 60% of all FHH and 86% of poor FHH receive Raskin, compared to 50% of all MHH and 79% of poor MHH. Poor urban FHH are even more over-represented among Raskin beneficiaries: 85% of poor urban FHH receive Raskin compared to 76% poor urban MHH. FHH are over-represented as Raskin beneficiaries in all deciles, for example 40% of the FHH in the 9th decile receive Raskin, compared to the national average of 25%. (See Table 3 and Table 5). The benefits of Raskin appear to be shared by all members of receiving households, with children being favored, and without any gender discrimination in allocation among household members. Indirect effects such as increased investment in education (with savings from subsidized rice) also appear to be gender neutral.

### Table 3: Social Protection Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MHH receiving Raskin</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHH receiving Raskin</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor MHH receiving Raskin</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor FHH receiving Raskin</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHH receiving Jamkesmas</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHH receiving Jamkesmas</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor MHH receiving Jamkesmas</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor FHH receiving Jamkesmas</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHH receiving BLT</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHH receiving BLT</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor MHH receiving BLT</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor FHH receiving BLT</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### Table 4: Age of Decile Receiving Raskin, 2009 (Coverage)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decile</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHH</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perfect Targeting</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Bantuan Langsung Tunai (BLT).** In 2005, subsidy cuts raised household fuel prices by an average of over 125%. BLT, an unconditional direct cash transfer in four installments over one year, funded from the implied budgetary savings from subsidy reductions, was one of the Government of Indonesia’s responses to these programmed increases in fuel prices. It targeted poor households who were benefiting least from the old subsidy regime and were most affected by price increases. BLT was used again in 2008 when international crises...
in both financial markets and in food prices combined with another domestic reduction to fuel subsidies. 40% of all FHHs, and 69% of poor FHH, compared to 24% of all MHH and 52% of poor MHH receive BLT (See Table 3 and Figure 2). Urban FHH (28%) and MHH (15%) seem to be at the most disadvantaged relative to their rural counterparts (FHH: 53%, MHH: 32%) while there is a more even spread between poor urban (PU) and poor rural (PR) households (PUFHH: 65%, PRFHH: 70%, PUMHH: 46%, PRMHH: 55%).

- **Jamkesmas** is a free health care program aimed at making basic health services available to the poorest 30% of the population by providing beneficiary households with health cards entitling them to free healthcare at local public health clinics and in-patient treatment in third-class public hospital beds, as well as obstetric services, mobile health services, immunizations and medicines. A higher proportion of FHH receives Jamkesmas relative to the national average, across all deciles. Among poor FHH, 57% receive Jamkesmas, compared to 48% of poor MHH. The spread is relatively even across urban and rural areas (See Table 3, Table 4 and Figure 3). The Jamkesmas was initially aimed at formal workers but has been expanded to also cover the informal workers through the regulation no PER.24/MEN/VI/2006 from the Minister of Labor and Transmigration.

![Figure 3: Percentage of Consumption Decile Receiving Jamkesmas Benefits (2009), by sub group](image)

**Table 5: Age of Decile Receiving Jamkesmas, 2009 (Coverage)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decile</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FHH</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Program Keluarga Harapan (PKH):** A pilot of a traditional household Conditional Cash Transfer (CCT) program, PKH, was introduced in 2007, aimed at reducing poverty and improving poor households' human capital. The program is targeted at the very poorest households and focuses on improvements in socio-economic conditions, children’s education, the health and nutritional status of pregnant women, postpartum mothers and children under 6 years, and access and quality of basic education and health care services. PKH applies the traditional CCT design with quarterly cash transfers to poor households identified through statistical means testing, with young children and pregnant women, who receive regular transfer ranging from USD 70 to USD 245 per year. The transfers are conditional on the utilization of basic health services and children's school attendance, and are transferred directly to women in the recipient households.

A recent PKH impact evaluation shows different outcomes for MHH and FHH, as well as male and female children in all households. In FHH receiving PHK, pregnant and new mothers demonstrate larger magnitudes of increase in pre-natal visits, assisted delivery, and delivery at facility, than in MHH. However, it is in MHH where post-natal visits, newborn weighing, rates of immunization and treated diarrhea are increasing faster. MHH with PKH also do a better job keeping school-age children in school for more hours, while FHH receiving PKH do a better job of discouraging waged child.
labor. Given that over half of the FHH in sample were headed by single women and thus lacking a second wage-earner that many MHH have access to, this result indicates that CCTs such as PHK can have a higher impact on single FHH where the opportunity costs of schooling, child labor, and expenditures are higher than for dual income MHH. There are also significant differences in the effects of PKH on outcomes for boys and girls. In health, breastfeeding behavior and rates of complete immunization increase by significantly greater amounts when the child is a boy, suggesting that male and female children do not always share equally in the gains in positive household behaviors encouraged by PKH.

- In 2001, PEKKA, a pilot program aimed at social and political empowerment of poor women, and in particular FHH, was introduced. FHH are often poorer than their male-headed counterparts of similar characteristics, and are further disadvantaged because women who head households do not receive equal recognition as household heads in their communities. The program aims to empower poor FHH along five dimensions: (i) economic welfare; (ii) access to (financial) resources; (iii) social and political participation; (iv) critical consciousness; and (v) control over their own lives. It has been operational in 8 provinces between 2001 and 2008, with around 9,000 members, and received funding to expand to 9 new provinces in 2010.

Gender sensitivity of current targeting methods needs to be reviewed to ensure that poor female headed households are adequately serviced in mainstream programs.

Indonesia has primarily used a mixture of Proxy Means Testing (PMT), community-based and geographical targeting. PMT constructs a non-consumption and non-income measure of household economic status from a relatively small number of household characteristics such as quality of materials used in housing construction, availability of electricity, source of drinking water and type of sanitation disposal, along with ownership of assets such as appliances and vehicles. This lends itself well to capturing poor FHH who might manage to keep up basic needs consumption levels but may not have access to other services or assets.

Community based targeting relies on local knowledge to identify the poor and vulnerable to determine potential program beneficiaries. While this may be straightforward in small rural communities, there is a danger that they become invisible in urban areas where decision makers may have less knowledge about all community members. Meanwhile geographical targeting involves using representative data to categorize regions with respect to priority for program quotas or implementation. This approach determines the number of poor within a population from a prior nationally representative household survey or census. A second targeting method, such as PMT or communi-
ty, is then often used to determine which households will become beneficiaries within priority regions or quotas. Given that this method targets entire regions rather than individual households it is not amenable for gender mainstreaming. Categorical targeting has also been used for smaller assistance programs targeting particular sub-populations, such as the FHH (see PEKKA above), or disabled.

Targeting of broad-based social protection programs needs to be improved. While scaling up programs such as PEKKA which specifically target poor FHH, or PKH which is conditional on addressing women’s health needs, is one way to address gender inequality, there is also scope for ensuring that poor FHH continue to be included in “mainstream” social protection programs, which mainly depends on whether or not they fall within the targeting criteria. Targeting is pro-poor but many poor households are excluded from program benefits while many non-poor households are included. Poor females are currently just as likely as poor males to benefit. Consequently improvements in targeting performance will benefit excluded poor females commensurably. The targeting methodology is currently being reviewed and revised by the Government (Poverty Reduction Team/TNP2K Working Group on Targeting), presenting an opportunity for including a gender perspective in the new methodology.

Recommendations

- The TNP2K Working Group on Social Protection should consider an in-depth gender analysis of all major social protection programs, going beyond a benefit incidence analysis of MHH and FHH, looking at the intra-household gender implications such as who makes the decisions on how the benefits are being used and who within the household is benefitting. (Note: Benefit incidence analysis refers to the quantitative analysis of who are the beneficiaries of each program, this can be broken down by location, gender, age, head of household, and any other relevant demographic characteristic).
- Policies to increase income generation and protection from economic shocks (ie health shocks, economic crisis, disasters, etc) of poor FHH particularly single FHH (where there are no other working age adults) in urban areas, need to be re-examined and strengthened. Social assistance programs aimed at keeping children in school, and accessing health care should target poor FHH and include conditions related to equal treatment of boys and girls within households.
- TNP2K Working Group on Targeting to consider how the new targeting methodology should capture specific characteristics of poor FHH, with attention to urban areas.
- The design and evaluation of broad-based programs should ensure that female household members benefit equally irrespective of intra-household decision making patterns. PNPM should also address the issue of gender equality in its program approach.
- Smaller social protection programs intended for marginalized and vulnerable groups, such as the PEKKA program for poor widows, have yet to be properly evaluated including their effectiveness and targeting outcomes.
- Missing programs in the social protection portfolio need to be designed with gender differences in mind. Key social protection programs, such as a public works scheme, are not currently available. The design of such programs requires attention to gender differences. For example, public works schemes often focus on infrastructure development and as such may exclude or marginalize women.
References:

GTZ (March 2011), "Gender Lens on Social Protection in Indonesia", Draft Report, Jakarta, Indonesia

ODI, SMERU (October 2010), "Gendered Risks, Poverty and Vulnerability: Case Study of the Raskin Food Subsidy Programme in Indonesia", ODI. London, UK.


Gender inequalities create specific vulnerabilities of men and women to the impact of disasters, conflicts and climate change.

The impact of a crisis depends to a large extent on the vulnerability of those likely to be affected. Vulnerability is the result of prevailing social, economic and political inequalities that are both contextual and change over time. While men and women experience distinct vulnerabilities, it is mainly women, especially from among the poor, elderly, ethnic or social minorities, who have more limited coping strategies and the highest risk of being affected by a natural disaster (see Box 1). This is not always the case, as in the 2010 eruptions of the volcano Merapi, where there were indications of more men than women victims, mostly due to pyroclastic heat waves, but also to a considerable extent by factors such as traffic accidents, heart attacks and suicide (BNPB 2010). In violent conflicts, it is also mostly young men who are the primary victims. Understanding vulnerabilities and challenges in any...
Earthquake. A well-organized civil society consulted intensively with disaster victims including women. As a result, for instance, volunteers and female police officers were strongly present in IDP posts, which could explain why there were fewer cases of gender-based violence among these IDPs unlike in other disaster situations low (Dewi, 2010).

Women are more vulnerable to suffer in conflict situations

Women experience distinct vulnerabilities during violent conflict situations particularly with men away fighting. In 2003, an estimated 23% of women in Aceh, of whom 60% had never attended school, suddenly became household heads as their husbands had either died or fled for security reasons (UNIFEM, 2006). Women are also victims of sexual harassment and violence. During 30 years of civil war in Aceh, women were victimized because they were wives or relatives of suspected Aceh Freedom Movement (Gerakan Aceh Merdeka/ GAM) guerrillas, suspected of being female GAM soldiers (Inong Balee) or suspected of having relationships with or supporting members of the Indonesian Armed Forces. The extent of cases is unknown as victims do not report abuse out of feeling of shame and fear of social stigma (see Box 2). Anecdotal evidence from Aceh, Poso and West Timor reveals that displacement and loss resulting from conflict, social unrest and disasters leads to high levels of stress or depression among women.

Women’s rights in emergency responses are often neglected or disregarded without due consultation and participation

Driven by the ‘tyranny of the urgent’ the emergency response in Aceh and Nias largely failed to consult women effectively with poor results. Damage, loss and needs assessments were mostly conducted by male-dominated teams, who mainly relied on male heads of households for information and feedback (Enarson, 2009, Komnas Perempuan 2007a). Disaster responses to the Merapi eruptions however benefitted from earlier coordination mechanisms to ensure gender sensitivity in emergency operations, such as the Gender Working Group set-up during the Yogya earthquake. A well-organized civil society consulted intensively with disaster victims including women. As a result, for instance, volunteers and female police officers were strongly present in IDP posts, which could explain why there were fewer cases of gender-based violence among these IDPs unlike in other disaster situations low (Dewi, 2010).

Women are more vulnerable to suffer in conflict situations

Women experience distinct vulnerabilities during violent conflict situations particularly with men away fighting. In 2003, an estimated 23% of women in Aceh, of whom 60% had never attended school, suddenly became household heads as their husbands had either died or fled for security reasons (UNIFEM, 2006). Women are also victims of sexual harassment and violence. During 30 years of civil war in Aceh, women were victimized because they were wives or relatives of suspected Aceh Freedom Movement (Gerakan Aceh Merdeka/ GAM) guerrillas, suspected of being female GAM soldiers (Inong Balee) or suspected of having relationships with or supporting members of the Indonesian Armed Forces. The extent of cases is unknown as victims do not report abuse out of feeling of shame and fear of social stigma (see Box 2). Anecdotal evidence from Aceh, Poso and West Timor reveals that displacement and loss resulting from conflict, social unrest and disasters leads to high levels of stress or depression among women.

Women’s rights in emergency responses are often neglected or disregarded without due consultation and participation

Driven by the ‘tyranny of the urgent’ the emergency response in Aceh and Nias largely failed to consult women effectively with poor results. Damage, loss and needs assessments were mostly conducted by male-dominated teams, who mainly relied on male heads of households for information and feedback (Enarson, 2009, Komnas Perempuan 2007a). Disaster responses to the Merapi eruptions however benefitted from earlier coordination mechanisms to ensure gender sensitivity in emergency operations, such as the Gender Working Group set-up during the Yogya earthquake. A well-organized civil society consulted intensively with disaster victims including women. As a result, for instance, volunteers and female police officers were strongly present in IDP posts, which could explain why there were fewer cases of gender-based violence among these IDPs unlike in other disaster situations low (Dewi, 2010).

Women are more vulnerable to suffer in conflict situations

Women experience distinct vulnerabilities during violent conflict situations particularly with men away fighting. In 2003, an estimated 23% of women in Aceh, of whom 60% had never attended school, suddenly became household heads as their husbands had either died or fled for security reasons (UNIFEM, 2006). Women are also victims of sexual harassment and violence. During 30 years of civil war in Aceh, women were victimized because they were wives or relatives of suspected Aceh Freedom Movement (Gerakan Aceh Merdeka/ GAM) guerrillas, suspected of being female GAM soldiers (Inong Balee) or suspected of having relationships with or supporting members of the Indonesian Armed Forces. The extent of cases is unknown as victims do not report abuse out of feeling of shame and fear of social stigma (see Box 2). Anecdotal evidence from Aceh, Poso and West Timor reveals that displacement and loss resulting from conflict, social unrest and disasters leads to high levels of stress or depression among women.

Women’s rights in emergency responses are often neglected or disregarded without due consultation and participation

Driven by the ‘tyranny of the urgent’ the emergency response in Aceh and Nias largely failed to consult women effectively with poor results. Damage, loss and needs assessments were mostly conducted by male-dominated teams, who mainly relied on male heads of households for information and feedback (Enarson, 2009, Komnas Perempuan 2007a). Disaster responses to the Merapi eruptions however benefitted from earlier coordination mechanisms to ensure gender sensitivity in emergency operations, such as the Gender Working Group set-up during the Yogya earthquake. A well-organized civil society consulted intensively with disaster victims including women. As a result, for instance, volunteers and female police officers were strongly present in IDP posts, which could explain why there were fewer cases of gender-based violence among these IDPs unlike in other disaster situations low (Dewi, 2010).

Women are more vulnerable to suffer in conflict situations

Women experience distinct vulnerabilities during violent conflict situations particularly with men away fighting. In 2003, an estimated 23% of women in Aceh, of whom 60% had never attended school, suddenly became household heads as their husbands had either died or fled for security reasons (UNIFEM, 2006). Women are also victims of sexual harassment and violence. During 30 years of civil war in Aceh, women were victimized because they were wives or relatives of suspected Aceh Freedom Movement (Gerakan Aceh Merdeka/ GAM) guerrillas, suspected of being female GAM soldiers (Inong Balee) or suspected of having relationships with or supporting members of the Indonesian Armed Forces. The extent of cases is unknown as victims do not report abuse out of feeling of shame and fear of social stigma (see Box 2). Anecdotal evidence from Aceh, Poso and West Timor reveals that displacement and loss resulting from conflict, social unrest and disasters leads to high levels of stress or depression among women.
men. Their reluctance to seek help because of socio-cultural barriers and scarce availability of psychosocial support potentially exposes women to sexual and non-sexual violence within and outside their family (Komnas Perempuan, 2007a).

Disasters also provide ‘windows of opportunity’ to address gender inequalities and advance women’s rights (see Box 3). Civil society organizations can seize opportunities presented by post disaster situations to advocate for women’s rights, as in the case of the second All-Acehnese Women’s Congress in June 2005 attended by more than 400 women from 21 organisations. This led to the Aceh Charter on Women’s Rights outlining the personal, legal, political, social, economic and cultural rights of women in the specific Acehnese context of Sharia Law which was endorsed by a broad coalition in politics and society including notable religious leaders. Badan Rekonstruksi dan Rehabilitasi Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam dan Nias (BRR) with strong support of international organizations acknowledged gender equality as a cornerstone of the recovery process (Enarson, 2010) with women’s rights in land titling as one of its flagship programs. In contrast to traditional practice in post-tsunami Aceh, in an estimated 30% of cases women were registered as land-owners (Harper, 2007) following a policy allowing joint land titling of husbands and wives adopted in September 2006.

### Box 3: Securing women’s right in post-tsunami Aceh.

In 2009, almost 30% of the legislative candidates running for office were women. Due to advocacy of women’s organizations in the course of the recovery process, the Women’s Empowerment Bureau in Aceh was upgraded in status to an Agency (Badan) giving it a wider mandate and increased funding. Several qanuns have been passed referring to some of the principles as outlined in the Women’s Charter: e.g. qanuns on Population Administration, Education and Women’s Empowerment and Protection.

Post-disaster recovery can provide ‘windows of opportunity’ to address systemic gender inequalities and advance women’s human rights

In searching for stability in times of crisis, traditional patriarchic norms may surge up on the basis that ‘all have suffered’. Women were not represented during the negotiations that ended the conflict and women combatants were initially excluded from the design of reintegration efforts. Most notably, women were largely absent from consultative processes and meetings including for the Master Plan for Recovery in Aceh. Donors initially accepted this on the grounds of local culture. In addition, the application of Sharia law became distinctly stricter post-tsunami, restricting women’s mobility and behavior and incurring human rights violations against women by the Sharia police (Human Rights Watch, 2010).

### Gender-based roles render women more vulnerable to the impacts of climate change

Global climate change is expected to create extreme weather events in Indonesia including extreme rainfall and rising sea temperatures and...
levels. This will affect people's lives in complex ways, encompassing areas as varied as agriculture and food security, forest and water resources, energy, health, natural hazards, migration and conflict. Indonesia is the world's third largest emitter of greenhouse gases and research and policy discourse has so far almost exclusively been dominated by natural scientists' perspectives on natural resources degradation. Limited involvement of social scientists has led to a lack of empirical data on gender-related vulnerabilities in climate change, however international research from places like Bangladesh and India supports the notion that vulnerability to climate change is strongly shaped by gender relations. Women's roles in small-scale farming communities as primary producers of food crops and fetching water and firewood puts them at high risk of being critically affected. Other risks include water scarcity and increased water- and vector-borne diseases increasing women's workloads in caring for sick and elderly, inadequate food supplies reducing food intake for women and girls and dwindling household incomes resulting in girls being pulled out of school first (UNDP/AusAID, 2009).

Gender inclusion in reconstruction and rehabilitation can reinforce gender equality and further empower women.

Livelihood programs in recovery often focus on the heads of households who are typically men, disregarding women's role in family livelihood strategies and neglecting single or widowed women. For example, economic rehabilitation in Aceh strongly focused on the fishery sector replacing boats, nets and other facilities and gear, largely ignoring women's role in processing and trading of fish (Cosgrave, 2008). Conversely programs for women often reinforced traditional female livelihoods such as cake baking and sewing, reinforcing gender disparities in terms of economic roles in the family and in recovery (Gender Working Group Aceh, 2007). Efforts to train women in non-traditional livelihood skills, such as painting and brick-making, had mixed outcomes because contractors in part refused to employ women (Nowak, Caulfield, 2008). Legal rights, specifically the ownership of land and assets or guardianship of children during post-disaster recovery are particularly sensitive issues that require specific attention and interventions in order to protect women's rights. Successful efforts to safeguard land rights of women in Aceh helped to increase the security of women headed households and ensure their access to productive resources and credit.

Men and women can play complementary roles in recovery from disasters: men generally carry out physical reconstruction while women contribute by extending psychosocial support and diversifying livelihoods. Women's awareness and knowledge is essential for effective risk management preparing homes, stockpiling food and maintaining social networks that disseminate information, educate children and communities. As shown by an evaluation of GTZ assistance after the Yogya earthquake, women were more responsive than men towards acknowledging the importance of earthquake safe construction practices and willing to invest into applying these principles (Holländer, 2008). Children also were acknowledged for their potential role in contributing to disaster reduction by communicating disaster risks (Haynes, 2010).
Men and women have different roles in mitigation and adaptation to climate change due to their distinctly different roles in livelihood strategies and in the household. For effective climate change mitigation, for instance, women will be crucial to contribute to more effective patterns of energy use, waste as well as natural resources management. In subsistence farming women usually contribute to about 70% to 80% of household food production (UNDP, 2009). Adaptation to climate change will, thus, require gender-responsive approaches to introduce new agricultural technologies and/or develop alternative livelihood strategies.

Establishment of National Agency for Disaster Management (BNPB) is designed to target and provide humanitarian assistance to the most vulnerable groups.

The Government of Indonesia through Presidential Decree No 8 year 2008 has established the National Agency for Disaster Management which reports directly to the President of Indonesia. This Agency will lead disaster related activities which include disaster risk reduction, emergency response, preparedness and recovery on behalf of Government of Indonesia. BNPB has established regulations and guidelines that ensure Indonesia’s disaster system effectively addressing the needs of the most vulnerable, including women and children, in times of emergencies, and lead the coordination mechanism in the aftermath of disaster. Good practices of BNPB were captured, for instance, during the Mt. Merapi volcano response operation in 2010, where BNPB collected sex-disaggregated data; made a special arrangement for pregnant women and families with infants at main collective centers and camps; and closely liaised with NGO gender working group.

Specific attention on women and men’s different roles and priorities in responses to disasters and climate change creates more sustainable results

International research has shown that men and women prioritize different needs and approaches in emergency recovery. Livelihood issues and access to shelter, water and sanitation facilities as well as psychosocial counseling typically rank highest for women, while men give higher priority to larger-scale infrastructure (Fordham, 2000). Direct cash transfers and revolving funds programs in Aceh that targeted exclusively women often proved to be more successful than those involving both men and women.

Gender-sensitive disaster risk management is needed to keep MDG achievements on track.

Sudden-onset disasters such as earthquakes, volcano eruptions or floods as well as the impacts of climate change erode achievements in human development. In post-tsunami Aceh poverty had increased from 28.4% to 32.6% while in the rest of the country poverty was decreasing (World Bank, 2008). Women from marginalized groups such as widows have greatest vulnerability in disasters which leads to further disempowerment and impoverishment. The number of early marriages increased in the aftermath of the tsunami, which is known to have long-term negative effects on all MDGs. Maternal and neo-natal health in post-tsunami Aceh was particularly at risk with higher levels of miscarriages, premature deaths and children being born under unsafe conditions (APWLD, 2005). Disaster recovery and risk management cannot be successful without taking on a gender lens in help achieve the MDGs in a sustainable way.

International research has shown that men and women prioritize different needs and approaches in emergency recovery. Livelihood issues and access to shelter, water and sanitation facilities as well as psychosocial counseling typically rank highest for women, while men give higher priority to larger-scale infrastructure (Fordham, 2000). Direct cash transfers and revolving funds programs in Aceh that targeted exclusively women often proved to be more successful than those involving both men and women.
Indonesian policy documents on disaster risk management are bound by the principle of equality before the law and government. The Government of Indonesia Law number 24 year 2007 on disaster management stipulates the principle of equality before the law and government, which means that content of provisions in disaster management cannot set out matters that differentiate against amongst others religious, ethnic, race, group, gender, or social status background. This principle also applies to the provision of early warning that is identified as one of pre-disaster events in the Law number 24 Year 2007.

The importance of effective early warning system is also highlighted as one of core action programs under priority 9 – environment and management of natural disasters – in the five year medium-term development plan (RPJMN) 2010-2014, which defined an equitable and just nation as one of eight national development missions. “Just” nation means that there is no discrimination in any form, among individuals, gender, nor among regions. The development of early warning system is further entailed in the National Disaster Management Plan 2010-2014 and the National Action Plan for Disaster Risk Reduction 2010-2012, both of which recognize that gender inequality will have an impact on the fate of women in disaster situations, and unequal position will be exacerbated by the special needs of women in disaster situations.

Research on gender-based vulnerabilities and collection of sex-disaggregated data related to disaster, conflicts and climate change is fundamental to designing and implementing gender-responsive policies measures. There are currently no official guidelines on the collection of sex and age-disaggregated data of victims and internally displaced persons (IDPs). Empirical research on distinct vulnerabilities in disaster situations as experienced by women in Indonesia is limited and mostly confined to the situation in Aceh and there is no empirical data at all of the specific conditions and risks experienced by men. Estimations of the numbers of victims in the 2004 tsunami was largely based on the ratio of survivors. World Vision estimated women accounted for 60% victims while based on a ratio of 3:1 for men and women survivors while Oxfam’s figure was up to 80% (Oxfam, 2005) and Flower Aceh calculated that 75% of IDPs were men. Emergency operations in Yogya during and after the Merapi eruptions in 2010 learnt from earlier experiences and benefited from the active role of many civil society actors. IDP data collected by civil society networks included comprehensive information on pregnant and lactating women, newborn or people with disabilities which were used to target assistance to some of the most vulnerable disaster victims (Dewi, 2010).

Policy Issues

Gender perspectives are still to be adopted and institutionalized in disaster recovery and management legal and policy frameworks.

The Government has put in place a national framework for disaster recovery and management which could be further strengthened. For example,
Standards, Procedures and Criteria (NSPK) in form of a Guidance on the Implementation of Women Empowerment and Child Protection (Ministerial Regulation No. 2/2008) stipulates the integration of women’s protection policies, programs and activities into all provincial and district planning and budget documents. While the NSPK on Gender- and Child- Data (Ministerial Regulation No. 6/2009) stipulates the collection, analysis; the use of sex and age disaggregated data in all provincial and district policies, programs and activities. However, BNPB as the lead agency at national level for disaster risk management so far has no unit or working group focusing on gender mainstreaming and there is not yet any gender mainstreaming strategy.

**Recommendations**

- BNPB to recruit gender expert and set framework conditions by developing basic gender mainstreaming strategies, policies and institutional structures
- BNPB to develop guideline, format, capacities for data collection and needs assessment
- BNPB to commission research on hazard- and location-specific disaster vulnerabilities, giving attention to different impact of disaster to women and men.
- Ministry of Environment and other government and non-government key players in climate change to promote and commission more research on gender and climate change, particularly gender-specific vulnerabilities, challenges and opportunities in climate change mitigation and adaptation.
- Gender perspectives to be mainstreamed in the development, implementation and evaluation of policies and programs for disaster risk reduction; response and adaptation to climate change with

Law No. 24/2007 on Disaster Management promotes non-discrimination of all citizens in protection, participation in planning and decision making and access to assistance in compensation. This would be greatly enhanced with an explicit call for gender mainstreaming, which includes social and gender analysis and affirmative actions. As acknowledged in the 2009 National Report on the Progress of the Implementation of the Hyogo Framework for Action, gender perspectives in disaster risk management policies and frameworks so far have received little attention and no significant institutional progress has been made.

The National Action Plan for Disaster Risk Reduction 2010-2012 (NAP-DRR) prepared by Bappenas with assistance from the World Bank and UNDP refers to the Hyogo Framework for Action and the Law No. 24/2007. The Plan includes one specific chapter on gender mainstreaming, but it does not promote gender mainstreaming for the entire action plan. Local governments in Yogyakarta, Central Java and Maluku have already moved ahead in preparing Local Disaster Management Action Plans, recognizing the importance of gender mainstreaming such as the Plans for the districts of Magelang and Sleman.

The National Action Plan for Mitigation and Adaptation to Climate Change (NAP-MACC/2007) acknowledges the multi-dimensional threat climate change poses on human and national development and outlines short-, medium- and long-term plans on mitigation and adaptation.

The Presidential Instruction on Gender Mainstreaming (INPRES No. 9/2000) stipulates the need to mainstream gender dimensions in the planning, development, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of all government policies and programs. The Norms, Standards, Procedures and Criteria (NSPK) in form of a Guidance on the Implementation of Women Empowerment and Child Protection (Ministerial Regulation No. 2/2008) stipulates the integration of women’s protection policies, programs and activities into all provincial and district planning and budget documents. While the NSPK on Gender- and Child- Data (Ministerial Regulation No. 6/2009) stipulates the collection, analysis; the use of sex and age disaggregated data in all provincial and district policies, programs and activities. However, BNPB as the lead agency at national level for disaster risk management so far has no unit or working group focusing on gender mainstreaming and there is not yet any gender mainstreaming strategy.
a focus on reducing gender-based vulnerabilities, strengthening resilience and enhancing women’s leadership.

- Cross-sectoral coordination to be carried out between the Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection (MoWECP), BNPB and other sectoral ministries in order to promote the adoption of internally accepted principles (e.g. Sphere Standards, UNDP Eight Point Agenda), the use of key instruments such as gender assessments, discussion of relevant research findings and integration of gender equality indicators in key policy papers and programs.

- BNPB to closely cooperate with initiatives under the Office of the Vice President to accelerate poverty reduction on how to mainstream issues around gender-sensitive disaster risk reduction in priority poverty reduction policies and schemes.

- Create awareness about the importance of gender mainstreaming in disaster risk reduction at national and local level disaster management institutions, particularly among district and village governments. This should emphasize the importance of compiling disaggregated data and gender responsiveness of public communication strategies.

- Disaster management agencies at district and provincial level to actively seek collaboration with NGOs who are experienced in applying internationally available knowledge and best practices related to gender mainstreaming.

References

Asia Pacific Forum on Women, Law and Development (APWLD) (2005), “Why are Women More Vulnerable During Disasters”.
Disaster Management Law 24/2007
International Disaster Database at www.emdat.be, Centre for Research on Epidemiology of Disasters (RED).
National Action Plan on Disaster Risk Reduction 2010-2012
National Disaster Management Plan 2010-2014


UNIFEM, 2006, “Women’s Voices in Aceh Reconstruction: The Second All-Acehnese Women’s Congress”.


The 2009 elections in Indonesia led to a significant increase in women’s participation in politics (elected office) and decision-making with the help of affirmative action for candidacy and political party participation which was introduced in 2008. Women’s representation in the Parliament (Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat, DPR) increased from 11% in 2004-2009 to 18% in 2009-2014 with similar increases across the provincial and district level DPR. Representation, however, has remained below the desired 30% and has remained inadequate in other critical areas of public service and decision-making roles. Significant disparities exist within political parties, across levels of government and between geographic regions, which constrains the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) for women’s empowerment. While Indonesia’s Constitution and legal framework acknowledges the equal rights of women and demonstrates a commitment to improving governance, improvements to current laws/regulations and increased implementation and monitoring could more effectively address institutional and socio-cultural barriers and support women in elected and decision-making roles.

Women’s representation in national elected roles remains disproportionate

It is generally accepted that the critical minority for representation is 30%; women need to make up 30% of an elected or decision-making body to adequately voice their concerns and opinions. This is reflected in the General Election Law 10/2008 that requires 30% women candidates running for the DPR at the national, provincial, and district level DPR. Representation, however, has remained below the desired 30% and has remained inadequate in other critical areas of public service and decision-making roles. Significant disparities exist within political parties, across levels of government and between geographic regions, which constrains the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) for women’s empowerment. While Indonesia’s Constitution and legal framework acknowledges the equal rights of women and demonstrates a commitment to improving governance, improvements to current laws/regulations and increased implementation and monitoring could more effectively address institutional and socio-cultural barriers and support women in elected and decision-making roles.

Figure 1 shows the participation of women in the DPR since 1955 has increased slowly and inconsistently. Figure 2 ranks women’s participation in the Southeast Asia region, revealing that Indonesia lags behind countries such as East Timor, Cambodia and Laos.
Women’s representation in the House of Regional Representatives (Dewan Perwakilan Daerah RI, DPRD) is higher than in the national DPR and increased from 22.6% in 2004 to 26.5% in 2009. This shows that voters do have confidence in women candidates to represent their interests in the DPD. Research is needed to determine why women have secured a higher level of representation in this legislative body. One possibility is that women running for the DPD do not need to be nominated by political parties and are independently elected. This suggests that women’s representation in DPR is not simply a reflection of the level of women’s interest in elected office but more critically an indicator of the continuing barriers for women seeking to enter politics. Such barriers include political party resistance, the Election Commission’s lack of enforcement, and broader discrimination against women.

Women’s representation in local elected bodies has increased slightly, with continuing geographical disparities

At the end of 2009, there was one woman governor among 33 elected governors (Banten) and one deputy governor (Central Java). Meanwhile, 2.2% of Vice Regents/ Mayors and 3.9% of village head positions were held by women. Despite appeals from women’s groups for affirmative action to encourage more women to run, direct local elections are not gender sensitive and have no legal provisions to encourage
the Regional General Election Commissions, political parties and other relevant bodies to promote women candidates (KapanLagi.com, 2007).

Political parties do not comply with the electoral gender quota and limit support of women by placing them in unwinnable districts and/or slots on the party list.

In 2004, the few women candidates who were placed in the first and second slots on candidate lists were placed in districts/electorates where voters favored other parties. This situation is explained in Box 2 that describes the story of Noor Balqis during the 2009 campaign, when her political party changed her electoral district (Siregar, 2006). This issue of district/electorate placement by political parties needs to be further researched and regulated.

Over 80% of elected provincial and district female members and over 90% of national level female members were placed in the first three positions on the ballot paper or the party list of candidates. While these numbers indicate some political party compliance with affirmative action, they also reveal candidate ranking affects voter choice. In light of the district/electorate placement issue, holding the first slot on the party list does not guarantee a seat in the DPR. Unless political parties are held accountable for the quota requirement and are monitored for their placement of women in both of these areas, the quota law will remain ineffective in securing a minimum amount of women in elected legislative roles.

Political parties’ support of women candidates varied noticeably in the 2009 election across levels of government and within political parties.

In 2009, among the nine parties that gained seats in the DPR, the Democrat Party (Partai Demokrat) contributed the highest percentage of women at 35% of the overall 18% elected. Gerindra and Hanura parties (new parties in the 2009 election) contributed the lowest at 4% (KPU data). At the provincial and district level, these political parties varied greatly in their support of women candidates. The Democratic Party had 25% women’s representation of the total women represented at the provincial level while the Prosperous and Justice Party (PKS) had 7%. The Golkar Party led with the highest representation of women at the district/city DPRD level with 20% women, while five of the top nine parties remained at or below 5% representation (Puskapol-UI, 2010). Support of women candidates within individual political parties varied from the DPR to the DPRD. For example, of the total seats that the PKB won in the election, 25% were assigned to women at the national level and only 9% at the district/city level. Figure 4 describes the disparity within political parties and their support of women at different levels of the DPR.

Box 2: Impact of placement

“At first, my party placed me in the first position in North Sumatra I electoral district. I come from this area. I know people there and they know me very well. But my party then moved me to North Sumatra III electoral district. I do not know people here and they do not know me either. I think that is why I could not be elected.”

Noor Balqis, only female member of the 1999-2004 DPR.

Source: Siregar, 2006

POLICY BRIEF 7
Political parties are not compliant with the quota law that specifies the percentage of women required in central management structure

Women who are not elected to decision-making positions within political parties have little opportunity to develop political skills and knowledge. This also keeps women from influencing the party agenda. Political Party Law No. 2/2008 and the revised Political Party Law No. 2/2011 require new political parties to have 30% women in their central executive boards. While this does not apply to established political parties (those that gain the majority of seats in the DPR), it sets an important precedent for all parties in Indonesia. Prior to the 2009 elections, all but one party had 30% women in their central executive board, although little information was known about what positions they held. Post 2009 elections, the numbers dropped significantly, in one case from 35% to 6.7%.

With a lack of enforcement by the Elections Commission and a limited requirement for information to be made available to the public on political party membership, political parties have the freedom to ignore the quota (Ministry of Law and Human Rights). Data available on women’s membership in the central executive boards of nine political parties during 2004 elections indicates that only the Democratic Party of Struggle (PDIP) had a had a woman in a top leadership position, none of the party secretaries were women and two parties, the United Development Party (PBP) and the PDIP, had female treasurers (Siregar, 2006).

Political parties lack established and transparent recruitment procedures for candidates and continue to hinder women’s electability despite the quota law

Because the rank of a candidate in the Indonesian electoral system is still the main determinant for winning a seat, political party recruitment procedures are incredibly important. Political parties each have internal regulations and rules for recruitment and ranking of candidates. Some political parties are willing to use internal regulations as a tool to include women in the central executive board and other party structures. The United Development Party (PPP), for example, requires 20% women to be on their central and local executive boards, down to district level (Republika Online, 2007). Other political parties, however, have used the internal regulations to exclude women; for example, parties often provide little support or educational opportunities for female candidates.

Figure 4: Percent of Women Members from Total Seats Won by Political Parties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Political Party</th>
<th>DPR RI</th>
<th>DPRD Province</th>
<th>DPRD District/City</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PDIP</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Golkar</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demokrat</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partai Kebangsaan dan Demokratik (PKS)</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hanura</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerindra</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Center for Political Study, University of Indonesia (Puskapol), 2010.
The Elections Commission must do more to ensure that the gender quota is fulfilled within political parties

It is the responsibility of the Elections Commission, as an agent of electoral law enforcement, to verify documents to ensure that each political party has fulfilled the gender quota in its candidate lists (Article 57 of the Quota Law) and to return documents of political parties which have not fulfilled the requirements so that they can redress the imbalance (Article 58, 1-2). Rather than enforcing these provisions, the Elections Commission has chosen instead to use printed media to publically announce a party's non-compliance. While the Elections Commission can be commended for taking this public action, further enforcement is needed by this governing body to fully ensure that regulations are adhered to.

There continues to be discrimination and resistance against women taking public political roles in Indonesia

A survey conducted by Komnas Perempuan prior to the 2009 election revealed intimidation and gender-based discrimination against female voters and legislative candidates. Chairperson Neng Dara Affiah was quoted saying, “In this election, it is still difficult for women, and this vulnerable group has often suffered from intimidation and has been more discriminated against in the lead-up to the 2009 election than in the 2004 general election” (Jakarta Post, 2009). Women who enter public life after raising a family are more likely to be seen as ill-suited for high political office because they lack relevant training and knowledge. As they cannot access resources and economic opportunities as easily as men, they struggle to finance campaigns. Political parties wary of losing power are reluctant to support women candidates they perceive as poorly trained or financed. Women also face discrimination because they pose a threat to male politicians and candidates; they have strengths that attract voters, including the perception that they have more integrity. The capacity of women needs to be strengthened to combat these obstacles.

Women’s representation in decision-making roles in government and the civil service remains low

Female headed ministries in the 2009-2014 Cabinet include the Ministry of Health (MoH), Ministry of Finance (MoF), Ministry of Trade (MoT), and the State Ministry for National Development Planning (BAPPENAS). The current Cabinet has four women out of 34 members (14.7%), similar to the four women out of 36 members in the previous Cabinet. This remains lower than the percentage of women in the DPR at 18% in 2009 (UNDP, 2010). Women also continue to be seriously under-represented in the top echelon of civil service positions where they constitute 8.7% compared with 46.3% of civil service officers overall (BKN, 2011). Their representation in top decision-making positions in all government ministries and agencies and in independent state-formed commissions is similarly low.

Box 3: Empowering Women in Village Decision-making Processes

The PNPM Generasi program is supported by the Women’s and Children’s Health Revolution Program and was started in NTT in 2009. It enforces a fine if women are not included in village decisions about activity funding including medical and posyandu health services. Focus group discussions are held for women where they can express their ideas. In gender-mixed forums, men tend to remain more active in voicing their opinions and still form the majority of village elite.

Source: Febriany et al., 2010
While decentralization could increase opportunities for women’s involvement in development planning, current practice suggests they are still excluded.

The Musrenbang Guidelines provide a mandatory requirement for the participation of women in annual village, sub-district, and district level development planning so that their concerns can be taken into consideration for programming and budgeting. This is stipulated in annual joint circulars from the State Minister for BAPPENAS, the Ministry of Home Affairs, and the MoF. Early research on the Guidelines’ impact found that men still played a dominant role, while many women play a token role, supporting their husbands or other male figures as seen in Box 3 (Syukri et al, 2011).

In the latest round of development planning (February 2011), several districts trialed a Musrenbang Perempuan prior to the regular village Musrenbang meeting so women could identify their priorities for consideration by the community. This needs to be carefully monitored to make sure women are not subsequently excluded from the mainstream planning process. Consideration also has to be given to improving the Musrenbang process overall, as there remains insufficient legislation and regulations to clarify the role, function and powers of community groups, NGOs and professional associations in local planning and budgeting. These challenges, combined with poor oversight by local authorities, limits the effectiveness and influence of the Musrenbang process (USAID, 2007).

Continuing stereotypes about the appropriate roles for women affect their ability to participate in decision-making.

Women in Indonesia are generally not considered to be the decision-makers at family or community levels. A recent opinion poll on the attitudes and perceptions of women’s social, economic and political participation revealed that 77.6% of male and female respondents believed that men should be the decision-makers of the community. In addition, 95% said that men should be the leaders of their households and 94% felt that women should not work without permission from their husbands (UNDP, 2010. p.23). Gender bias in knowledge, attitudes and practices continues to exist nation-wide and reveals the need to expand education and gender-training programs for all ages.

Policy Issues

Indonesia’s commitment to international agreements fuels continued commitment to empowering women

The MDGs, to which Indonesia became a signatory in 2001, form an overarching framework that places human rights and poverty at the center of development policies. An indicator for progress in MDG3 for gender equality and women’s empowerment is the proportion of seats held by women in the National Legislature. In a recent survey, respondents chose ‘Indonesia’s commitment to international treaties and agreements’ as a main factor influencing a desire to increase women’s representation (IFES, 2011). Throughout the 2009 election period, discussions in media and a number of surveys confirmed that one area of reform in the electoral system that enjoys pop-
ular support is the greater participation of women as candidates in political races. A diversity of Indonesians believe that the proportion of women in legislatures is too low and there is strong support for quotas to increase the number of women on party lists for legislative elections (USAID, 2009).

The government has strengthened its commitment to women in politics and decision-making through National Development Plans

The National Medium Term Development Plan 2009-2014, as part of the National Long Term Development Plan (RPJPN) 2005-2025 discusses improving the quality of life and the role of women. Goals found in the chapter include the following: “The assurance of gender equity in various laws, development programs and public policy…” (Chapter 12). This commitment, while commendatory, has yet to result in significant increased representation for women in politics or decision-making.

Indonesia's quota law regarding the participation of women changed in 2008, resulting in a stronger, yet flawed gender quota for parliaments and political parties

Law No.10/2008 on General Elections, unlike the 2003 voluntary gender quota law, includes a clear quota for the nomination of women. The law grants political parties the opportunity to present closed lists (through Article 214) while requiring that at least one in every three candidates on the list be a woman (Article 55). A closed list system gives political parties the right to directly select representatives to the DPR. Political parties are required, by the 2008 Political Party Law, to include 30% women on their central boards. In December 2008, the Constitutional Court declared Article 214 unconstitutional in regard to equal rights for all as well as the rights to freedom of association and freedom of expression (Constitutional Court Decision, 2008). This resulted in a semi-open system just months before the election, making voter preference a determining factor for election (Bessell, 2010). Voter preference was heavily influenced by candidate ranking on the party list and political party support, as discussed above.

Indonesian Women’s Caucuses and women CSOs have played an active role in ensuring the government’s policy commitments to women are implemented

The Indonesian Political and Parliamentary Women’s Caucuses work to increase women’s involvement in Indonesian politics and serve as a gathering place for women members of the DPR. Women NGOs and CSOs are strategic partners in women’s political empowerment and were crucial in pushing for the quota law and other key legislation regarding women’s rights (i.e. Elimination of Domestic Violence Law). Currently, 17.5% of the total NGOs registered in Indonesia address women’s issues or implement a gender program (SMERU, 2010). CSOs, however, still need to find ways to become active and sustainable at the local level to offer opportunities for women across all sectors of society and government.

Recommendations

- Sector agencies, the Ministry of Home Affairs, the Ministry of Law and Human Rights, and the Elections Commission, monitored by the Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection (MoWECP), to improve provisions to achieve the gender quota for 2014-2019 DPR through placement criteria and a mandatory one-in-three zip-
per mechanism, with an additional requirement to have at least 30% women on the first and second places on the candidate list.

- Election Commission to have stronger oversight authority in order to take stronger measures against non-compliance, including restricting political parties’ participation in electoral districts where they do not meet the regulated placement and nomination requirement of 30% women candidates.

- Elections Commission to collect sex disaggregated data that is incorporated into its decision-making processes and is made available to voters, candidates and elected members of parliaments by sex.

- Ministry of Home Affairs to make public the process of elections at all levels of government, particularly since political parties now receive state funds based on the calculation of their seats in the parliament.

- Ministry for State Apparatus, in coordination with the MoWEC, to increase numbers of women in high echelons of government institutions including technical agencies, ministries and state-formed commissions through a systematic career acceleration program, including educational scholarships.

- CSOs and Women’s Caucuses, supported by ministries and the Cabinet, to cooperate in increasing public awareness through school curriculum and civic education about gender and social equality in politics and decision-making.

- CSOs and Women’s Caucuses, supported by ministries and the Cabinet, to collaborate on improving women and men’s participation in and capacity for public office through training programs at the local, provincial, and national level, including regular follow-ups and impact assessments.

- Ministry of Home Affairs, Ministry of Finance and National Development Agency (Bappenas), in coordination with local governments and Regional Representative Council (DPD), to establish targets and mechanisms for women’s engagement at the local development planning level with an additional provision and oversight mechanism included in the annual Circular Letter on the Guideline for Musrenbang Processes.

Reference:
State Employment Agency (BKN), January 2011.
Center for Political Study (Puskapol), University of Indonesia, (2010), “Representation of Women in Political Parties and Election Regulations”, December 2010.
Constitutional Court Decision No. 22-24/PUU-VI/2008, section 3.15.1, p. 27-41
Komisi Pemilihan Umum (KPU) data, www.pemilu.asia
SMERU NGO database, 2010.
USAID (2007), "Musrenbang as a Key Driver In Effective Participatory Budgeting Key Issues and Perspectives for Improvements", Local Governance Support Program, USAID, 2007

This Policy Brief highlights progress and outstanding issues related to violence against women (VAW). This is defined by the Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women (1993) as “any act of gender-based violence that results in, or is likely to result in, physical, sexual or mental harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or in private”. The Government of Indonesia signed the Declaration in 2004 with other ASEAN countries and has put significant legislative and policy measures in place. However, slow and inadequate implementation continues to make women highly vulnerable to abuse throughout Indonesia. Efforts are needed now to strengthen law enforcement, educate service providers and the wider community about VAW and extend services for survivors of abuse and perpetrators in both urban and rural areas. The increasing trend of human trafficking for forced labor and prostitution demands a greater synchronized effort at the national level and a focus on transnational responses to improve prevention, protection, prosecution and reintegration.

Current Status:
- Domestic Violence

Domestic violence has grown as a policy issue in Indonesia since 2004

Law No. 23/2004 on Domestic Violence was a major achievement of the National Commission on Violence against Women and the women’s movement in Indonesia. The law expands the definitions of both domestic violence and potential victims of domestic violence, criminalizes sexual harassment for the first time in Indonesia, and acknowledges the rights of victims. Various facilities to assist victims were built in the 2004-2009 period, including Integrated Service Centers for the Empowerment of Women and Children, Integrated Crisis Centers, and Special Service Rooms in a number of provinces and districts/cities. The National Development Plan 2010-2014 recognizes that steps for increasing the quality of protection to women and children need to be expanded across the country. In addition, the Roadmap for Accelerating the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) has identified “improved protection for women against all forms of abuse” as a priority for achieving MDG3 for Gender Equality and makes a commitment to “improving the protection of women’s rights against all forms of violence through prevention, service support, and empowerment” (Bappenas, 2010)
Despite legislation aimed at changing community understanding about gender-based violence and providing services to victims, implementation is affected by the prevailing view that this is a private matter, supported by cultural and religious norms. Additionally there is no consensus on what constitutes VAW. However, Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) regards human trafficking as a form of slavery. As one of the largest independent Islamic organizations in the world, NU’s fatwas carry much weight in Indonesian society. In their Fiqh Anti Trafficking publication of 2006, the organization released a Fatwa decision that forbid human trafficking and labeled it “Haram”. But domestic violence has yet to be recognized by decision-makers and citizens as a serious social, economic, and governance issue. More needs to be done through enforcement of the law, research, education and services to strengthen prevention, protection, prosecution and recovery for victims, perpetrators and their children.

The full economic and social costs of domestic violence need to be calculated.

Impacts of violence for victims include anxiety and depression, physical stress, suicide attempts, reduced coping and problem-solving skills, and loss of self-esteem and confidence. Women are vulnerable on a personal level regardless of position, income or education. Children witnessing violence experience emotional and behavioral problems including poor school performance, stress, reduced social competence, bullying and excessive cruelty to animals, and relationship problems. These consequences of domestic violence for victims and witnesses result in a loss of productivity and significant demands on social services including health, police, legal, education, and welfare. As yet, the full costs of domestic violence at individual, family and community level have not been quantified. This could help the Government and wider community to better understand the benefits that accrue from reductions in incidence of domestic violence.

Domestic violence remains poorly documented with incomplete data on incidence.

Nationwide figures on domestic violence do not reveal the complete picture because of under-reporting. The independent National Commission on Violence against Women (Komnas Perempuan) recorded a doubling of reported cases in 2008 from 2007. 143,586 cases of violence were reported in 2009 compared to 54,425 cases in 2008 (see Figure 1), (Komnas Perempuan, 2010). The increase is attributed to better data collection and more women reporting cases but does little to lend understanding to the depth of the frequency of domestic violence, (Komnas Perempuan 2008). Estimates for 2010 of around 105,000 cases of violence show a slight decrease from 2009 (100,000 victims) with over 96% occurring in the home, (Jakarta Post, March 2011). But, as the Commissioner of Komnas Perempuan, remarked: “That number does not mean that the total and intensity of the violence has decreased”, (Suartika, 2010).

Figure 1: Reported cases & type of violence 2010

Sumber: Komnas Perempuan, 2010
A study in 2006 on conflict and dispute resolution that confirmed a rise in the number of reported cases, found that domestic violence was one of the seven highest types of conflict/dispute reported at the district level, (McLaughlin, 2010). Criminal activity and land/building disputes were the most common, followed by family-related disputes and domestic violence. Most NGOs working on women and children’s issues believe the real figure of women affected by violence is far higher, noting the tendency of many victims to keep silent because of a lack of services and a view of domestic violence as a private issue, (UNUPR, 2008).

Despite the expansion of institutions for assisting victims in recent years, services remain insufficient for the amount of women who suffer from violence in Indonesia.

National institutions assisting survivors of violence include the military court, shelter and trauma centers established by the Ministry of Social Affairs, and the Women’s and Children’s Units (Unit Pelayanan Perempuan dan Anak), formerly the women’s police desk, (Ruang Pelayanan Khusus). In 2008, Komnas Perempuan reported that there were 41 Women Crisis Centers, 23 Integrated Centers for the Empowerment of Women and Children, 129 police stations with services for women and children and 42 hospitals that provide services for women victims of violence, (Komnas Perempuan, 2008). These services are insufficient in number and capacity to meet demands, with numbers of reported cases reaching more than 50,000 in 2008. Diversity in every police force is essential to combat gendered crimes effectively. Police tend to ignore or de-prioritize certain crimes, including those crimes that affect women more than men, such as sexual abuse, domestic violence and trafficking. For example, services rarely report to the police while the low numbers of trained female police officers can affect victims’ willingness to report cases of violence. Gender training for police officers together with an acceleration program for women within the police force should be established. In addition, there are too few women law enforcement officers in the Criminal Research Department. Only 4% of investigating officers are women, which is insufficient to assist female victims of rape and domestic violence and to deal with female criminal suspects, (Amnesty International, 2009). Although the Indonesian Police Chief Regulation number 3/2008 states that there has to be a Special Service Room in every City/County Police Station to deal with sensitive cases including crimes against women, there are limited personnel to deal with those cases. Many women tend to report abuse to informal leaders and their village administrations (see Figure 2) and most cases are solved by informal leaders under close custody of village officials who can disregard protective legislation. According to an NGO, Rifka Anissa, only 10% of domestic violence cases end up in court, (Kompas, 2010).

In addition, women face financial issues when trying to seek assistance offered by the government. Legal representation is required by law to be offered at a low-cost. However, NGOs and activists report that
many women are deterred from seeking assistance because of the high fees for representation. The Indonesian Women’s Association for Justice and Legal Aid Institute (LBH-APIK) is an organization providing legal support for women (free for those unable to pay) and campaigning for recognition of legal rights which has been active since 1995.

Despite the issuing of Law No. 23/2004 on Domestic Violence, in several regions like Bali, for example, the local custom runs counter to Article 9 of the Domestic Violence Law, which states that people are banned from “bringing about economic dependence by limited or prohibiting an individual to work properly inside or outside the house”. Women in some districts in Bali handover all possessions to their husband when married, and lose everything in the case of divorce, (Jakarta Post, Sept 2010). Muslim women also lose assets and custody over children should they file for divorce with the use of ‘nusyuz’ principle. The national government needs to ensure that there is consistency between national and local laws in regards to the protection of women from violence and abuse. Local societies should be empowered to demand these protections and adequate services.

Local customary laws override the national domestic violence law, weakening promised protection for all women in Indonesia.

Despite the issuing of Law No. 23/2004 on Domestic Violence, in several regions like Bali, for example, the local custom runs counter to Article 9 of the Domestic Violence Law, which states that people are banned from “bringing about economic dependence by limited or prohibiting an individual to work properly inside or outside the house”. Women in some districts in Bali handover all possessions to their husband when married, and lose everything in the case of divorce, (Jakarta Post, Sept 2010). Muslim women also lose assets and custody over children should they file for divorce with the use of ‘nusyuz’ principle. The national government needs to ensure that there is consistency between national and local laws in regards to the protection of women from violence and abuse. Local societies should be empowered to demand these protections and adequate services.

Figure 2: Cases of Violence against Women Reported to Service Providers

Many women return to abusive homes in which they were abused, revealing the need for a more coordinated strategy to provide services for men.

Rifka Annisa Women’s Crisis Center in Yogyakarta estimates that 90% of women return to their husbands after abuse, (Jakarta post, Sept 2010). In light of this reality, little is being done by the government to counsel men who are abusing women in their lives. Under the 2004 Domestic Violence law, judges can order men to undergo counseling, but there are few government programs and it has fallen to the CSO sector to provide this service with minimal resources (See Box 1).

Box 1: Rifka Annisa Women Crisis Center

Started in Jogjakarta in 2009, this counseling program helps men learn to manage their anger. Nur Hasym from Rifka Annisa is optimistic about the program because to date 28 men have completed the program voluntarily. But he sees that men still struggle with sharing power in the home.

Source: Jakarta Post, December 2010.

Current Status:
• Human Trafficking

Government commitment to address human trafficking is well-demonstrated.

Law No. 21/2007 on the Eradication of the Criminal Act of Trafficking in Persons, also known as the Anti-Trafficking Law, signifies the Government of Indonesia’s commitment to addressing the issues of human trafficking. Article 1 defines human trafficking as: “… an act of recruitment, transportation, harboring, sending, transfer, or receipt of persons, by means of threat, or use of violence, of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or vulnerable position, or the giving of payment or benefits to achieve consent of a
**POLICY BRIEF 8**

A person in control of the other person, committed in the country or trans nations, for the purpose of exploitation*. This definition is consistent with the Protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children, supplementing the UN Convention against Trans-national Organized Crime. Indonesia ratified the UN Convention and the Protocol in 2009.

### Indonesia is both a source and transit and destination country for human trafficking.

Many Indonesian migrant workers have gone to Malaysia, Singapore, Brunei, Taiwan, Japan, Hong Kong and the Middle East and end up trapped in commercial sex work. Indonesia is not only a sending country but also a recipient country of trafficked people. US Department of State Report noted that the majority destinations of the trafficking in Indonesia are areas in Java, West Kalimantan, Lampung, North and South Sumatra and Nusa Tenggara, (US Department of State, 2009), while UNICEF recognized that West Java and West Kalimantan are the main areas of origin for trafficking in Indonesia, (UNICEF, Child Trafficking 2010). In most cases, trafficking involves forced labour and forced prostitution and mostly occurred in border areas.

### Data on actual number of people trafficked is scattered and difficult to obtain.

UNICEF estimates that 100,000 women and children are trafficked annually for commercial sexual exploitation domestically and internationally, (UNICEF-CSEC, 2010). Many are likely to be young, given that 30% of female prostitutes in Indonesia are under 18, while 40,000-70,000 are victims of sexual exploitation. During the period of March 2005-December 2009, IOM assisted around 4,581 victims, including 3,330 females and 885 children, (IOM, 2010). In the same period, the Indonesian Police Bareskrim (2009) reported 1,457 victims in 407 cases. The Legal Aid Foundation (LBH-APIK) in Pontianak noted at least 49 cases reported by the local media during the period of 2008 to 2010 and they helped to advocate 18 cases in West Kalimantan in the same period, (LBH APIK Pontianak, 2011). The Ministry of Women Empowerment and Children Protection (KPPA) confirmed that the trend from year to year shows that the majority of the cross-border human trafficking victims in Indonesia are women and girls with the main destination country is Malaysia (75%), (MoWECP, 2011). There is an iceberg phenomenon in which only a few numbers of cases are officially reported to the police every year.

### Female migrant workers, domestic workers in Indonesia and sex workers are vulnerable to trafficking as they lack legal protection and complaints mechanisms.

Women comprise around three-quarters of Indonesia’s migrant workers, mostly in unregulated domestic work and continue to be one of the least protected in the region. Coming mostly from rural areas with low levels of education, they are vulnerable to unregulated recruitment practices, indebtedness,
exploitation and abuse. Women migrant workers are at risk of trafficking: 55% of trafficking victims assisted by International Office of Migrant in Indonesia were exploited domestic workers, 89 percent of whom were women, (Solidarity Center, 2010). There is a correlation between the level of education and the incidents of human trafficking. Most of the victims of human trafficking are those that the education are junior high school or below (see Figure 4).

**Figure 4: Level of Education of the Indonesian Trafficking Victims (March 2005-Sept 2009)**

![Level of Education of the Indonesian Trafficking Victims](image)

Source: IOM as quoted by MoWECP, 2010

Different interpretation of human trafficking and lack coordination among authorities.

Civil Society Organization (CSOs) suggested that key challenges in the implementation of the Anti Trafficking Law are mainly due to lack of understanding of the authorities on the human trafficking itself and lack of coordination among government agencies in addressing the issue. The Anti Trafficking Law is interconnected with other laws such as the Law on Child Protection, on Immigration, on Crime, on Migrant Workers on Manpower, on Citizenship, on Protection of Witnesses and Victims and on Placement of Indonesian Migrant Workers Overseas. In many cases, the perpetrators of human trafficking were prosecuted not by the Human Trafficking Law but by other laws such as the Indonesian Criminal Law (KUHP) or Labor Law as in the case of cross-border forced labour cases. In cases involving cross-border child prostitution, often the perpetrators were prosecuted under the Child Protection Law which provides for lesser penalties. Improved collaboration between governments will better protect the victims, prosecute the proponents and disrupt traffickers’ networks. Similarly, CSOs must continue to take part in the overall effort to combat trafficking and participate in all dialogues related to prevention of and response to human trafficking.

**Policy Issues**

*Indonesia is a signatory to regional and international covenants that must be adhered to and respected.*

Indonesia is a signatory to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) and ratified the Convention in 1984 (with reservations). In addition, an Optional Protocol to the CEDAW was signed by the Indonesian Government in 2000. The Convention defines violence as any act of gender-based violence that results in, or is likely to result in, physical, sexual or mental harm or suffering to women, including threats of such acts, coercion or arbitrary deprivation of liberty, whether occurring in public or in private life. At the regional level, the Foreign Ministers of the ASEAN countries signed a Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women on June 13, 2004. The Declaration encourages regional cooperation in collecting and disseminating data for righting violence against women, promotes holistic and integrated approaches in eliminating violence against women, and endorses the conduct of gender mainstreaming and the amending and formulating of domestic laws to prevent violence against women. ICPD+15, suggested a more comprehensive approach that addresses the root causes of migrant workers, reintegration process of returning migrants,
and more intensive cooperation and dialogue with recipient countries may need to also be envisaged.

Law No. 23/2004 on Domestic Violence was a major achievement of the National Commission on Violence against Women.

This law expands the definitions of both domestic violence and potential victims of domestic violence, criminalizes sexual harassment for the first time in Indonesia, and acknowledges the rights of victims. These rights include 1) protection of the victim by the police, judiciary, court, lawyers and social institutions; 2) medical service in accordance with the victim’s medical needs; 3) the victim’s right to confidentiality; 4) support by social workers and provision of legal aid at every stage of the investigation; and 5) counseling services.

Regulations and guidelines to improve services for victims of violence have been developed.

Assistance to victims was expanded through the 2002 Joint Agreement Letter between the State Minister for Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection, the Minister of Health, the Minister of Social Affairs, and the Chief of National Police, that provides for integrated physical, psychological, medication and treatment, social and legal services. Ministerial Regulation No. 1/2010 stipulates that funds to support services for victims can come from both national and local budgets while Ministry of Women Empowerment’s Regulation 1/2010 on Minimum Service Standard establishes the baseline level for delivery of those services. However, with most funds for the service centers coming from the local government, private donation and/or donor funding to NGOs, it is questionable how far minimum standards can be met.

The National Commission on Violence against Women (Komisi Nasional Kekerasan Terhadap Perempuan) has been influential but is constrained by limited authority.

Komnas Perempuan was established in October 1999 by Presidential Decree No. 181 to increase public awareness about women’s rights, promote survivors’ rights to recovery and rehabilitation, and advocate for more effective policy to address violence against women (see Box 2). It is the only institution that continuously compiles national data on violence against women. It has worked closely with 367 community-based organizations around Indonesia and the Asia-Pacific region and international networks to develop national measures to combat all forms of violence against women. But the Commission is under the direction and authority of Komnas HAM which limits its authority and ability to propose budgets and influence government policy.

Procedures and mechanisms to support the implementation of the Anti-Trafficking Law have been formulated.

The Government has recognized the problem and taken action in four areas: prevention, protection, reintegration and prosecution. Since the implementation of the law 21/2007, the US Trafficking in Persons Report (2008) noted the significant increase in the arrests, prosecutions and convictions of human trafficking cases especially for traffickers of sexual exploitation. Under the law, penalties to traffickers range from
three to fifteen year of imprisonment. The Presidential Decree No. 69/2008 established task forces at different levels to improve coordination and monitoring of the implementation of the Law. The national-level Task Force, led by the Coordinating Ministry of People’s Welfare, has 19 related government institutions while task forces have been formed in 18 provinces and 60 Districts. Ministerial Decree No. 25/2009 stipulates a National Plan of Action (NPA) on the Elimination of Human Trafficking and Child Sexual Exploitation which essentially aims to improve collaboration, explore bilateral agreements between Indonesia and the recipient countries in protecting migrant workers, establish a prevention system, educate government and community about human trafficking, enforce the implementation of the laws and establish legal aid and referral system for victims. The Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection has conducted a series of anti-trafficking training in all 33 provinces and six provinces and two cities have developed their own NPAs. The Provinces of West and East Java, North Sumatera, Riau, South and North Sulawesi, Lampung, West and East Kalimantan, Nusa Tenggara and Districts of Sambas and Indramayu have all issued local regulations (PERDA) on Trafficking in Persons.

Joint efforts are made by ASEAN to tackle cross-border cases.

In October 2010, the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) launched the ASEAN Handbook on International Legal Cooperation in Trafficking in Persons Cases which provides a step-by-step guide to prosecute trans-national cases. The Handbook helps to improve the cooperation between criminal justice officials involved in cross-border trafficking investigations.

Recommendations

- Police Department, Ministry of Law and Human Rights, Attorney General Office to strengthen implementation of the Domestic Violence Law by educating and training police officers, prosecutors, judges and new recruits in these professions. Even though the Domestic Violence Law stipulates that victims of domestic violence do not need to complain first to the police before they take any action against the perpetrator, still most police officer are not responsive in handling domestic violence. Perception that domestic violence is a personal and internal family affairs remains strong amongst enforcement agencies’ officer. Proper understanding of the matter through training in the police academy and training, in guideline and regulations from the attorney general office, is needed.

- Ministry of National Education, Ministry of Information, Association of teachers and local governments to work together to improve citizens’ knowledge of the law regarding the protection of women from violence through public and formal education. Many perpetrators of domestic violence are merely perpetuating their childhood experience and imitating gender-based violence behaviors that are tolerated by the society. Changing the perception that domestic violence is not a
private matter and it is punishable by law should start at school and other public announcements. Participation of men in building this new culture and understanding is also important.

- The Indonesian President must immediately declare legally null and void all discriminatory local by-laws that violate the human rights of citizens and fail to protect women from violence and marginalization, especially the violations experienced by women and minority groups, in accordance to the responsibility of the state to uphold human rights.

- Ministry of Law and Human Rights, Ministry of Religious Affairs, local government and Ministry of Home Affair to conduct gender training for religious court judges. The training will provide necessary argument on the issue of domestic violence and the use of Domestic Violence Law as their consideration to avoid women victims of domestic violence losing their assets and custody over their children.

- Ministry of Law and Human Rights to increase the amount of shelters and relief services for victims of violence including corrective counseling for perpetrators of domestic violence, as specified in the 2004 Domestic violence law and provide adequate funds for those services.

- Encourage local governments to increase the amount of shelters and relief support centers for women who have been subjected to violence, including medical, psychological, and other counseling services and free or low-cost legal aid. Judges must more frequently order men to undergo counseling because most women return to their homes after abuse and violence. Without systematic measures to help and assist the perpetrators, violence will continue. Funds need to be allocated to district and municipality courts as well as to family courts to hire counselors for battered victims and to correct the behavior of the perpetrators.

- Establish a national standard and requirement for compiling data on violence against women which can be used as an advocacy tool to urge the government to address specific issues. Research regarding the impacts of violence against women should be supported by the Government, results of which can be used to create better assistance and prevention policy and awareness-raising strategies. In addition, develop and support a regional database on trafficked persons, and facilitate exchange of information and repatriation. Institutions that handled victims of violence such as hospitals and Puskesmas need to be given guidance on reporting the cases to the police.

- Strengthen implementation of Law No 21/2007 among law enforcers. The Law 21/2007 is interconnected with other laws such as the Law on Child Protection, on Immigration, on Crime, on Migrant Workers, on Manpower, on Citizenship, on Protection of Witnesses and Victims and on Placement of Indonesian Migrant Workers Overseas. The integration of the Laws into the educational curriculum for training new police, prosecutors and judges’ new recruits could be one of the strategy to increase the knowledge and skills of the law enforcers in handling the cases of human trafficking.

- Improve government’s measures to protect migrant workers through legislation, compliance mechanisms, support services and training for new police entrants.

- Improve Regional Cooperation to Prevent and Address Trafficking Issues. Considering the natures of the human trafficking itself, more solid and integrated cooperation among countries of the ASEAN need to be done.
References


Jakarta Post, 8 March 2011. Data was collected from 384 institutions offering services to help violence survivors.


LBH APIK Pontianak (2011), “Data on cases reported on the victims of sexual exploitation”, LBH APIK Pontianak in January 2011


